



# Qila Saifullah

Integrated Development Vision



The designation of geographical entities in this book, and the presentation of the material, do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of IUCN concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

**Published by:**

Government of Balochistan, Pakistan and IUCN Pakistan,  
Balochistan Programme office.



**Copyright:**

© 2007 Government of Balochistan, Pakistan and IUCN, the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources.

Qila Saifullah: Integrated Development Vision (IDV) was prepared by IUCN Pakistan.

The IDV was supported by the Royal Netherlands Embassy (RNE).

Citation is encouraged. Reproduction and/or translation of this publication for educational or other non-commercial purposes is authorised without prior written permission from IUCN Pakistan, provided the source is fully acknowledged.

Reproduction of this publication for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without prior written permission from IUCN Pakistan.

The contents and the opinions expressed do not constitute an endorsement by the RNE.

**Citation:**

Government of Balochistan and IUCN Pakistan (2007). Qila Saifullah: Integrated Development Vision. IUCN Pakistan, Quetta, Pakistan. xiv+84 pp.

**Editor:**

Dhunmai Cowasjee

**ISBN:**

978-969-8141-94-3

**Design:**

Azhar Saeed, IUCN Pakistan

**Printed by:**

Hamdard Press (Pvt.) Ltd.

**Available from:**

IUCN Pakistan  
Balochistan Programme Office  
Marker Cottage  
Zarghoon Road  
Quetta, Pakistan  
Tel: +92 (81) 2840450/51/52  
Fax: +92 (81) 2820706  
[www.iucnp.org](http://www.iucnp.org)

Abbreviations	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Executive Summary	iv
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Background	2
1.2 Process	4
1.3 District Vision	6
Chapter 2: Local Governments for Good Governance	9
Chapter 3: Social Sectors	19
3.1 Education	20
3.2 Water Supply and Sanitation	24
3.3 Health	27
3.4 Gender and Development	30
3.5 Settlements and Housing	32
3.6 Sustainable Livelihoods and Poverty Reduction	35
3.7 Culture and Tradition	38
Chapter 4: The Natural Resource Base	39
4.1 Climatic Information	40
4.2 Drought	40
4.3 Land Use	43
4.4 Water	43
4.5 Agriculture	47
4.6 Livestock and Rangelands	49
4.7 Forests	53
4.8 Biodiversity and Protected Areas	55
Chapter 5: Diversifying the Economy	57
5.1 Minerals and Mining	57
5.2 Small and Medium Enterprises	59
5.3 Tourism	60
5.4 Infrastructure: Roads and Energy	62
Chapter 6: Information and Communication	67
Chapter 7: Future Programmes and Projects	71
Chapter 8: Implementing the Vision	73
8.1 Institutional Arrangements	74
8.2 Financial Resources	74
8.3 Monitoring and Evaluation	76
References	77
Annexure 1	80
Annexure 2	82
Annexure 3	84

# Abbreviations

BCS	Balochistan Conservation Strategy
BHU	Basic Health Unit
BLGO	Balochistan Local Government Ordinance 2001
BPRSP	Balochistan Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
CCB	Citizen Community Board
CDGK	City District Government Karachi
CDS	City Development Strategy
CIS	Community Information System
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DCO	District Coordination Officer
EDO	Executive District Officer
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
GIS	Geographic Information System
GoB	Government of Balochistan
GoP	Government of Pakistan
IDV	Integrated Development Vision
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
IWRM	Integrated Water Resources Management
Karez	Underground gravity irrigation channel devised to tap groundwater in arid regions
LG	Local Government
LHV	Lady Health Visitor
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MICS	Multiple Indicators Cluster Survey
NASSD	Northern Areas Strategy for Sustainable Development
NCS	National Conservation Strategy
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
OSR	Own Source Revenue
P&DD	Planning and Development Department
<i>QSIDV</i>	<i>Qila Saifullah Integrated Development Vision</i>
<i>QSSoED</i>	<i>Qila Saifullah State of Environment and Development</i>
SMEs	Small and Medium Enterprises
SPCS	Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy
SPDC	Social Policy Development Centre
TMA	Tehsil Municipal Administration
UC	Union Council

Much credit is due to the Zila Council of Qila Saifullah that had the foresight to realize the need for a development 'vision' for their district, a framework that attempts to address the complex and interlinked economic, social and environmental issues facing the area. It was at their request that IUCN stepped in to assist with the formulation of a long-term 'vision' for development in the district based on the current state of play in key social, economic and natural resource sectors, captured in a companion document the *QSSoED*.

The entire district participated in the formulation process. Zila Nazim Maulvi Anwar-ud-Din, Naib Zila Nazim and Speaker of the Zila Council Haji Asmat Ullah, Tehsil Nazims Molana Muhammad Lal Akhundzada and Maulvi Muhammad Arif all contributed their ideas as did the DCO and EDOs in the district government and officers from the TMAs and UCs.

In addition, there were individuals, including Senator Nawab Muhammad Ayaz Jogazai, Sardar Wazir Ahmad Jogazai, Nawabzada Mehboob Jogazai, former Naib Zila Nazim Sardar Asif Sergarh, Sardar Allah Yar Jogazai, former Tehsil Nazim Qila Saifullah Usman Kakar and Sardar Naseer Tareen who provided far-sighted and visionary input.

Gratitude is also due to the secretaries and senior officials of the Balochistan provincial government, staff of Balochistan Area Development Programme, representatives of the private sector, including the Balochistan Kissan Committee and Chromite Miners Association as well as to CSOs at the provincial and district level. The support of the print and electronic media and academia in Qila Saifullah District and Quetta is also acknowledged.

IUCN Pakistan's (IUCNP) Balochistan Programme Office role in developing the framework under the leadership of Syed Muhammad Saleem Chishti with support from IUCN staff, especially Dr. Abdul Majeed, Ahmad Sher and Muhammad Zaman Khan, is duly recognized. Thanks are also due to Abdul Latif Rao and his colleagues, especially Dr. Muhammad Nawaz Syal and Aizad Ehsan, for developing the documents. Finally, the financial assistance provided by the Netherlands government through the Royal Netherlands Embassy, Islamabad, is acknowledged and appreciated.

The BLGO 2001 established a local government system that devolved political, administrative and financial responsibility and authority to elected representatives of the local government. The zila nazim, as head of the district government, was given the authority to provide a 'vision', the direction for the district's development that would enable good governance, effective delivery of services and transparent decision making through institutionalized participation of people at the grassroots level.

This vision is the result of a wide-ranging consultative process undertaken in the district. The vision was launched through workshop chaired by the zila nazim and attended by all key stakeholders in May 2006. A series of consultations at the union, tehsil, district, provincial and federal levels were also held to seek information on key issues, their priority and development potential, current initiatives undertaken and planned, available options and possible strategies and measures.

At the same time, a comprehensive search for data and information on the district was initiated, covering traditional published sources, non-published material as well as web-based documentation. Meetings were held with individuals in the district government and private organizations to obtain current data on specific sectors. The *QSSoED* captures the baseline data collected on the social, environment and economic sectors in the district.

The input and proactive participation of people led to identification of core areas of concern and suggestions for short-, medium- and long-term measures towards remediation. These suggestions, together with important lessons learned from past programmes and projects in the district and province as well as experiences of current federal and foreign-assisted projects, particularly those supporting devolution and decentralization, were all considered. What emerged was a framework that identifies sectors that must be given priority, recommendations for their sustainable development over the long term and implementation mechanisms. The draft of the *QS/DV* was shared with stakeholders before being finalized and approved by the Qila Saifullah Zila Council.

As such, the IDV is the people's vision for their future, of the quality of life they aspire towards and the progressive milestones they would like to achieve. The IDV is organized according to priorities identified by people. The first four blocks are on governance, people and their development needs, the natural resource base on which livelihoods depend and potential for economic development in the district. The following three blocks are on information and communication, future projects and programmes and implementation arrangements.

## District Vision

The *QS/DV* is among the first in the province of Balochistan. What the people have decided is that their vision for the future is: "[A] district of



A busy street in the Qila Saifullah Town

aware, informed, educated, democratic, peaceful, cultural and gender-conscious, progressive, honest, clean, healthy, hardworking, capable, efficient, reliable and responsible citizens who enjoy justice, equity, social services, basic facilities, sustainable livelihoods, development opportunities, healthy environment, security and enabling conditions to contribute to their own and their district's development and prosperity and better quality of life where cultural and natural heritage as well as religious values are preserved, conservation and sustainable use of natural resources is practiced and poverty and illiteracy are history."

The IDV is hinged on four principles used during the consultative process and equally applicable during implementation:

- Consultation and participation of people and communities in planning and development
  - Emphasis on gender equity in policy, plans and programmes
  - Stress on people and environment-friendly development
  - Integrated, coordinated and sustainable development planning and monitoring
- The district's priorities are:
- improving governance and institutional and human capacity with an emphasis on promoting collective rather than individual interests, supported by strong and effective institutions staffed by competent individuals
  - promoting effective, efficient and equitable public services that can provide quality education, health and water supply and sanitation facilities
  - planning sustainable large and small urban settlements with efficient public services, water supply and sanitation amenities, sufficient energy provision and communication infrastructure
  - sustainably manage all sources of water by practising integrated water resource management and increasing water productivity
  - emphasizing agriculture practices that value water by switching to efficient

irrigation systems and crops that improve productivity per unit of water

- managing rangelands sustainably and increasing livestock productivity of livestock
- enhancing forest cover and vegetation to meet timber and non-timber forest product needs as well as environmental services
- conserving wild flora and fauna through community-managed protected areas
- increasing livelihood opportunities and reducing poverty through improvements in the mineral and mining sector, growth in value-added small- and medium-sized enterprises, developing commerce and trade markets in the district for the region and becoming a transport hub
- managing district-level information for decision making and communicating it to the public by collecting accurate data and information on all sectors and disseminating it widely

## Good Governance

People in Qila Saifullah underscored the need for good governance and public accountability, meaning governance that can respond to people's needs irrespective of gender, ethnicity or caste affiliations. Decentralization and lower-tier administrative entities like the district, tehsil and union administrations are meant to improve governance and foster grassroots participatory planning essential to sustainable development. But this requires systems and processes to assist coordination between the federal-, provincial- and district-level governments and new partners such as civil society, the private sector and the *ulema* as well as the capacity to monitor indicators and track progress. Above all, it requires the ability to continuously realign development priorities to changing ground realities.

The Qila Saifullah district government has to manage these requirements against a

backdrop of constraints inherent in the devolution process, including uneven fiscal decentralization, reduced managerial authority and poor institutional and human capacity at all levels of government. Similarly, the district government will need to advocate recommendations with high-tier administrative authorities while adopting best practices in district governance from models currently being used in other districts.

## Social Sectors

### Education

Education is one of the top priorities in the district. This is not surprising given the low literacy and enrolment rates: 22 percent for those 10 years and above and 28 percent for children between the ages of five to nine years. There is a large gender gap — female literacy rate for ages 10 years and above was 11 percent while the male literacy rate for the same age bracket stood at 31 percent — with a tilt in favour of boys' education and schooling in urban areas. Few tertiary education institutions exist and there is not a single vocational or technical training institute in the district. While resources have been pumped into Qila Saifullah through foreign and federally-funded programmes, their impact will only be visible in time.

Immediate steps are required to increase enrolment, retention and completion and improve the quality of education in all three levels of schooling. Establishing vocational or technical training institutes and mainstreaming *madasahs* is equally important, as is facilitating female access to schooling, particularly in rural areas, and advocating for girls' education among local communities. Initiatives will also have to address the need for hiring trained male and female teachers, controlling teacher absenteeism and lack of opportunities for in-service training. Existing resources would need to be used optimally to improve physical infrastructure as well as quality of teaching and learning material. All this would need to be supported by a monitoring system that could assess the standard of education by setting learning milestones and

measuring outcomes. Finally, all initiatives in education in the district need to work synergistically with better coordination with the provincial education department and ongoing federally-funded and foreign assisted-projects.

## **Water Supply and Sanitation**

Water availability is the key to development in Qila Saifullah. The district depends on groundwater and rainfall for its water supply, with drinking water obtained from open surface wells, tubewells, ponds and springs. Only 19 percent of households have access to drinking water in their homes while 34 percent of households enjoy adequate access to improved drinking water sources. In practical terms, this access means that water sources are located within a two-kilometre radius and require a 30-minute trek to collect water.

Against this backdrop, interventions need to focus on improving adequate access to improved drinking water sources in both urban and rural areas of the district, ensuring equal access to sources that are within a two-kilometre distance of homes. The quantity and quality of water also need to be considered in the longer term.

Qila Saifullah has poor sanitation and solid waste disposal practices. Most people use open places as sanitary facilities. Where facilities such as toilets and latrines are available, as in the urban centres, there is no sewage system. The same problems affect solid waste management and disposal that is burnt, dumped in open spaces or thrown into drains and watercourses.

It is recommended that the situation be remedied by involving new partners such as CCBs and CSOs in encouraging and assisting in the construction of household sanitation facilities and sewerage systems. For its part, the local government would have to take responsibility for setting-up wastewater treatment plants in larger settlements. Municipal solid waste management practices together with household and local government management of solid waste collection and disposal at designated sites would need to be put in place.

## **Health**

Health facilities in Qila Saifullah are inadequate and generally of poor quality, primarily because of untrained and insufficient number of medical and paramedical staff, inoperative units and dispensaries and the tendency to focus on curative rather than preventive healthcare. In case of women, cultural norms make the situation even worse. As women are mostly restricted to their homes, they are unable to access facilities located at a distance. Also, they are only allowed to be treated by women at women-only facilities.

In the health sector, the focus will have to be on improving service levels through preventive medicine, increasing maternal and infant health coverage, controlling communicable diseases and increasing access to trained male and female medical and paramedical staff. Equally important is the need to coordinate with the provincial health department, federal government and foreign-assisted projects working in the district.

## **Gender and Development**

Women's access to social services and other infrastructure is limited due to age-old customs that restrict their mobility, preclude them from seeking employment and decision making. The situation is the same, if not worse, in Qila Saifullah where a strong patriarchal social structure presents a traditional challenge to human development and gender equity. Women are inadequately represented in politics, local government departments and the labour force and have few opportunities to expand their economic productivity.

Changes in conservative societies require a process-oriented approach that tries to work within local culture to set in motion a process of change. Both men and women should be involved in efforts to minimize the social risk of change for women. Advocacy on the role and contribution of women to societal development will have to be undertaken with the help of opinion leaders to highlight the position accorded to women in Islam, their rights and responsibilities. Interventions will need to increase women's access to

education and health services, water supply, sanitation and clean energy sources and facilitate their participation in the labour force and small enterprises.

## Settlements and Housing

Qila Saifullah is primarily rural, the urban area in the district being no more than six percent. Most settlements in the district have grown organically rather than being systematically planned. Since little urban planning and zoning has taken place, there are many problems in providing social services and basic utilities. Settlements have also mushroomed along the National Highway (N-50) in Zhob Valley. Housing quality is poor with one-third of the population still living in one-room units of poor construction, increasing their vulnerability to disease and natural disasters such as earthquakes.

This situation offers Qila Saifullah the opportunity to plan urban settlements, either through the transformation of big villages into towns or through the establishment of planned mid-sized towns that would attract households from sparsely located villages. Supported by urban town planning guidelines,

master plans can be used to administer the growth of cities while zoning and growth management can help manage land use and the pace of urban development, respectively.

## Sustainable Livelihoods and Poverty Reduction

Poverty was traditionally measured through income disparities but has now broadened to include other measures of well-being. A multi-dimensional approach to poverty implies giving attention to empowerment and reducing livelihood insecurity as well as maximising income growth.

A participatory poverty assessment undertaken between 2001 and 2002 in Balochistan concluded that the poor defined poverty as lack of access to financial or material possessions. The assessment also brought to light other dimensions of poverty, including the inability to make and influence decisions at the household, community and policy levels, social exclusion due to gender, ethnicity, caste or religion and little or no access to institutions that provide resources such as education, credit, security and justice.



Mukhtar Azad

A young rag-picker in the field

To counter these disadvantages, the assessment forwarded four recommendations: improve access and control over resources, including natural resources, provide adequate social protection, eliminate discrimination based on gender, ethnicity or caste and ensure equal rights to justice regardless of gender or social status. These recommendations became part of the BPRSP that focused on engendering growth, managing scarce water resources, reforming governance, improving human development and addressing vulnerability to natural or man-made disasters. Accordingly, the district's thrust would be to implement the recommendations of the BPRSP, including economic growth through development of small- and medium-sized enterprises, investments in human capital and adequate social protection and access to natural resources for the poor.

## Culture and Tradition

Tribal affiliations, customs and traditions continue to govern life in Qila Saifullah. In the past, changes were slow due to the district's isolation and the reliance of communities on themselves or their neighbours. But in a global world supported by rapid communication, traditions are changing quickly. Communities are expected to adapt to changing circumstances or risk being left behind.

Though positive traditions can be retained, customs that are hindering progress need to be discarded. It is important that justice based on legislation and Islamic options is promoted instead of decisions taken by tribal *jirgas* or assemblies. Stakeholders such as local tribal elders and the ulema need to be exposed to new ideas and experiences prevalent in the Muslim world, primarily through dialogue and exposure visits. They should also be encouraged to play a positive role in the transition to a progressive society.

## Natural Resource Base

### Climatic Information

Mean annual rainfall in Qila Saifullah ranges between 125 and 500 millimetres, most of

which falls in winter as snowfall. It is important to note that this data is not fully reliable as it has been collected from the meteorological station at Zhob instead of Qila Saifullah which has no such facility. That said, accurate meteorological data is needed for water basin management and an early warning system for mitigating the impact of droughts. Considerable variations in rainfall at the local level mean that site-specific data is also needed. All this data needs to be collected in collaboration with the Pakistan Meteorological Department and be part of a larger national meteorological information network. Information also needs to be available to users such as farmers and graziers in an appropriate form and in a timely fashion.

### Drought

Extended periods of abnormally dry weather and below average rainfall is nothing new for Qila Saifullah district in particular and Balochistan in general. Periodic droughts occur regularly and more often than not wreak havoc in the district. For instance, the prolonged drought that beset Qila Saifullah between 1999 and 2004 decimated livestock and severely affected fruit and rain-fed cereal production.

Drought differs from other natural disasters in that their impact accumulate slowly over a considerable period of time, are spread over large geographical areas and may linger on for years after the episode. This means that drought preparedness and early warning are key issues that need to be coordinated with provincial and federal agencies responsible for disaster management.

### Land Use

Accurate and detailed information on land and land use is not available in Qila Saifullah. Integrated land use planning is absent and the land settlement record dates back to 1955. Therefore, the exact geographical area of the district plus its cultivable area remains uncertain. Rangelands, forests and biodiversity hotspots have also not been surveyed and assessed. In light of this, the interventions must include a comprehensive GIS-based inventory of land use and natural

resources, revision of the land settlement record and integration of land use planning in new projects and programmes.

## Water

The Zhob River and precipitation are the only sources of surface water in Qila Saifullah. But as the Zhob River and almost all its tributaries can go dry, precipitation remains the major source of surface water in the district.

The Zhob Basin has limited potential for development: groundwater is in balance in the Muslim Bagh sub-basin, in deficit in Qila Saifullah and in limited surplus in Zhob. This means that groundwater mining where abstraction of water exceeds recharge capacity is prevalent in Qila Saifullah. Primarily, this scenario is the result of the large number of tube wells in the district (1,888 in 2002 – 2003) due to an earlier government subsidy as well the current subsidy on electricity tariff for tube wells. The problem is exacerbated by a reduced recharge rate due to decreasing vegetation cover in the district.

Heavy grazing, unsustainable removal of vegetation for firewood and inappropriate agricultural practices have resulted in soil erosion and desert pavement-like conditions on the surface, drastically limiting water percolation to depths where it can recharge groundwater. Precipitation flows as surface run-off and drains quickly into streams and tributaries of the Zhob, neither remaining locally available as soil moisture nor adding to groundwater reserves. Surface water is also collected through traditional water harvesting practices but these too are not being used to their full potential.

But it is the inefficient use of water for agriculture that is the most serious issue facing the district. Farmers continue to favour inefficient agricultural practices such as flood irrigation and tend to overlook the fact that water is becoming scarce.

Under these circumstances, Qila Saifullah needs to urgently adopt two approaches: integrated water resource management and increasing water productivity. The district also needs to rationalize use of agricultural

tubewells, introduce technology-intensive irrigation methods, improve water conservation by identifying crops suitable for the area, increase groundwater recharge through plant cover and artificial recharge and encourage efficient rainwater harvesting practices.

## Agriculture

Agriculture is the mainstay of Qila Saifullah's economy. Besides crops such as wheat, *jowar*, barley and maize that are cultivated using ground and rain water, a bulk of the produce in the district is cultivated on irrigated land. Farm sizes are generally small and women are not directly involved in allied agricultural activities such as grain storage and manure collection.

The preference for tubewell-irrigated agriculture has led to unsustainable use of groundwater at the cost of neglecting the *khushkaba* and *sailaba* farming systems. Inefficient irrigation practices are still in vogue in Qila Saifullah with high delta fruits, vegetables and other crops grown over large areas. Consequently, the boost in total yield is due to expansion in cultivable area rather than an increase in average yield per hectare.

But land resources too are being inadequately managed, resulting in loss of fertile top soil, declining fertility and deteriorating soil structure. Land evaluation for agriculture using remote sensing and GIS technologies has not been carried out. Similarly, there is no local market for fruits and vegetables and agro-based SMEs are unheard of in the district.

If agriculture production is to improve, technology-intensive irrigation systems, effective maintenance of top soil, introduction of low delta crops or fruit trees, agro-based SMEs as well as an independent marketing infrastructure and availability of agricultural credit will have to be introduced. This is also an area where women's participation in economic activity can be enhanced. Experiments with farming cooperatives, where small holdings less than 5 ha in size are integrated into bigger farms and managed collectively, greenhouses for cultivating high-value and off-season vegetables and organic farming could also be adopted.

## Livestock and Rangelands

Livestock rearing of small ruminants such as goats and sheep is the second most important economic activity in the district. More than two-thirds of the total geographic area is used as rangeland with transhumance livestock production being practised. But the productivity of small ruminants has been declining over the years.

Poultry farming is not practiced on a commercial scale in the district. Livestock are generally underfed, suffer from diseases and internal parasites and arrive at markets looking undernourished and much below their optimal weight. Veterinary services are poor and large herds rather than quality animals are preferred. Women could play a larger role in agriculture but they do not have access to information or training opportunities for improved livestock care or credit.

Rangelands have been severely degraded over the years because of lack of grazing management and removal of shrubs and trees for fuel and periodic droughts. This has led not only to decrease in rangeland productivity but also the carrying capacity of the land that have far-reaching social and environmental implications.

Therefore, it comes as no surprise that the full potential of livestock and rangeland resources is not being realized despite the fact that it can play a major role in poverty reductions. Concerted efforts are needed to overhaul existing livestock production systems, introduce value-added dairy farming, facilitate engagement of women in poultry farming, establish markets and upgrade veterinary facilities and public sector extension services along migratory routes.

## Forests

Coniferous and scrub forests are found in the district, the former at 1,500 to 3,500 m with chilgoza and kail as the dominant species and the latter at 500 to 1,500 m with wild olive, ash and willow being the heavyweights. Qila Saifullah's forests are under threat from indiscriminate logging for fuelwood and timber, heavy livestock grazing and encroachments. Forest vegetation in the wider

countryside is also being lost as there is no land management system.

Three areas have been declared as state forests: Khatoka, Tarawal and Nasai but they are not physically controlled or managed by the forest department. There are no forest nurseries that can provide planting stock for afforestation and agro-forestry is not practiced in the district. Forest statistics are also unavailable.

Given that the majority of people are dependant on this natural resource on a number of fronts such as fuelwood for heating and cooking, timber for construction and non-timber forest products for medicinal and specific environmental services, the current area under forest cover is clearly inadequate for the requirements of the district. Steps need to be taken to raise forest nurseries, promote plantation of multi-purpose species and agro-forestry and reduce commercial harvesting of wood.

## Biodiversity and Protected Areas

Qila Saifullah is fairly rich in wild fauna, ranging from small rodents to large ungulates and cats. There are plenty of resident and migratory birds, particularly cranes and waterfowl, as the Zhob River is on the route of autumn and spring migrations between Afghanistan and India. The well-known Torghar Community Conservation Area in the Toba Kakar Range developed from a project to stop illegal hunting and conserve the dwindling populations of the Suleiman or straight-horned markhor and Afghan urial, categorized respectively as endangered and vulnerable. Along the way, social and economic welfare programmes were designed and developed for the people of the area, creating incentives for the involvement of locals and their families in conservation efforts.

But Torghar is an exception. Most wildlife and waterfowl species in the district are on the decline, illegal trapping of cranes and falcons is common and the Zhob River's potential as a wetland is declining. The district needs to raise awareness of the value of biodiversity and critical habitats, establish protected

areas, develop management plans for key sites and involve communities in conservation.

## **Diversifying the Economy**

### **Mining and Minerals**

Balochistan is part of a geological belt known for world-class mineral deposits. In Qila Saifullah, a number of metallic and non-metallic minerals are being mined in Muslim Bagh tehsil with chromite and magnesite as the most important, followed by gabbro, granite, limestone and sandstone. What is lacking is value-addition that could be achieved by processing at source, particularly of chromite, promoting commercial-scale mining of other minerals and encouraging expansion of the dimension stone industry. Also, increased investments will only be possible if the extent and value of mineral deposits in the district is ascertained along with other basic information such as annual production. At the same time, the district will need to enforce safety and occupational health guidelines in mines to protect workers, enforce environmental impact assessments to assess and curtail environmental and social impacts and engage in regular environmental audits to ensure adoption of mitigation measures.

### **Small and Medium Enterprises**

There is not one small-, medium- or large-scale enterprise, let alone industry, in Qila Saifullah. Minerals, livestock, fruit and vegetables farming are some of the areas that offer the possibility of developing innovative small- and medium-sized enterprises that could provide new services, create jobs and foster social development. A thorough analysis of the SME sector and potential enterprises can be initiated in the district would be a good starting point. Sub-sectors with high potential for growth and private sector investment should be targeted and enabled by providing technology, credit, training opportunities and a marketing infrastructure. Enterprise development also provides an opportunity for involving women in the labour force and in turn expanding their economic productivity.

### **Tourism**

Qila Saifullah hosts several cultural assets, including ancient forts and a narrow-gauge railway line, globally significant wildlife and plants, scenic landscapes, orchards and mineral wealth. All these can attract tourists to the district and create an impetus for new industry, enhancing economic activity in the area. The district could also be one of the destinations on tourist trails in Balochistan. Such trails would have to be promoted in collaboration with provincial and federal agencies such as Pakistan Tourism Development Cooperation as well as the private sector.

### **Roads and Energy**

Though Qila Saifullah is a rural district, it is connected with other parts of the province and the country by road through the Quetta-Zhob-Dera Ismail Khan (N-50) and the Qila Saifullah-Loralai-Dera Ghazi Khan (N-70) national highways that await improvement as part of a priority transport corridor through Balochistan linking Pakistan, Afghanistan and Central Asia. The remainder of the road network is shingle or dirt.

Qila Saifullah district has a narrow-gauge railway line, though the service was closed in 1985. But there are plans to develop a broad-gauge railway line connecting Gwadar with China, with the Quetta-Dera Ismail Khan section passing through the district. It would be important to maximize the benefits of these infrastructure projects by participating actively in their design, planning and implementation while minimizing their impact by ensuring that environmental and social mitigation measures are strictly followed. Also, town planning guidelines and controls to reduce ribbon development along highways and railway lines would need to be put in place.

There is a severe shortage of energy in Qila Saifullah. Households meet their requirements through biomass (primarily fuelwood), kerosene, liquid petroleum gas and electricity. There is little commercial consumption of energy, a factor that has prevented the development of SMEs dependant on an adequate supply of electricity or gas or



Aerial view of the Qila Saifullah Town, showing the television booster

improvements in standards of living, health and education.

Women are disproportionately affected by this lack of energy as they are the primary users of energy. They are also exposed to a variety of health hazards, including respiratory diseases, from cooking over indoor fires in poorly ventilated homes.

The main challenge is to develop a comprehensive energy sector plan for Qila Saifullah. Given the rural nature of the district, the strategy would have to address rural energy needs, particularly for small-scale domestic and agricultural production activities. The energy plan should also address energy concerns of women.

## Information and Communication

The information base on Qila Saifullah District is sparse. The information that does exist is scattered as Qila Saifullah does not have any geographic or management information systems to process data. This means that the district lacks basic data for informed decision

making. The problem can be addressed through systematic collection of reliable data in all sectors, introducing GIS-based management information systems in all departments and by basing all decisions on accurate and current information.

Besides information generation, information sharing with the public is also needed. Relevant and accurate information that is publicly available leads to consensus building, encourages collective efforts to solve issues as well as transparency and accountability of the public sector. Efforts have to be made to raise awareness on a number of social service, gender, environmental and cultural issues and elicit opinions on programme, project design and implementation using a variety of communication channels. Given the literacy rates in the district, oral and visual communication through radio and television will also be required.

## Future Programmes and Projects

Qila Saifullah District hosts several federal and provincial programmes and projects with more

planned for the future. Though development opportunities may accrue as a result of these initiatives, many challenges need to be tackled to optimize the social, economic and environmental benefits from these schemes. To take advantage of these large-scale projects the district government will have to be an active participant in the design, implementation and monitoring of these projects and advocate for pro-poor and gender options to be pursued, follow recommendations of environmental impact assessments, adopt effective mitigation measures, foster public-private partnerships and participatory decision making and implementation.

## Implementing the Vision

The responsibility for implementing the IDV is not restricted to the local government. A wider group of stakeholders, including CSOs, business, media, academia, communities, provincial government, Water and Power Development and National Highway authorities, Pakistan Railways and the federal government.

The district would strive for complete devolution of power, fiscal decentralization and revenue generation by building capacity to identify, develop, resource and implement programmes and projects that would put the IDV into practice. In doing so, it would make use of the various federal and provincial programmes and projects being implemented in the district and launch its own initiatives.

An Integrated Development Vision Steering Committee will be established to oversee

and guide implementation. Comprising 12 to 15 members, the committee will be headed by the zila nazim and draw representatives from public sector organisations, political parties, religious institutions, local chiefs and elders, private sector, including the Kissan Committee, transport, trade and commerce sectors, CSOs, academia and media.

A Management Committee headed by EDO, Finance and Planning, comprising key implementing agencies, including CSOs, will be established to ensure coordination, address implementation problems and oversee monitoring and evaluation. In addition, the Sustainable Development Forum under the chairmanship of the speaker of the zila council will encourage participation of a large group of stakeholders in development planning.

Financial resources and their efficacy will be enhanced by adopting a number of approaches. These include implementing all projects in the district through the district government, irrespective of the source of funds, prudent allocation of funds with a focus on project impact, stringent controls on public spending, raising local revenue, discouraging misappropriation of funds and tapping grants and development aid.

Implementation milestones would be worked out in collaboration with implementing agencies, with administrative and financial assistance being provided, if necessary. Internal and external monitoring at six-monthly and 12-monthly intervals, respectively, will also be institutionalized.

# Introduction

In Pakistan, districts are administrative units, the residents of which enjoy reasonably easy access to the administration. With periodic mergers and reorganization by governments, the number of districts has not remained static. The district of Qila Saifullah was carved out in 1988 from the larger Zhob district, with another part of Zhob, the Badini sub-tehsil, being added later on. Currently, Qila Saifullah comprises two tehsils and sub-tehsils spanning the entire Zhob Valley, including its upper reaches.



Qila Saifullah District is bound on the north-west by Afghanistan, on the north and east by Zhob District, on the west by Pishin District and on the south by the district of Loralai. The most commonly used figure for the geographical area of the district is 6,831 sq km, though the Survey of Pakistan has reported 10,609 sq km. The district's limits start some 88 km from Quetta on the Quetta-Zhob-Dera Ismail Khan road.

The greater part of the district consists of mountains, hills and rocks, intersected on the south by the Zhob Valley, an immense stretch of alluvial plain extending from the Kan Mehtarzai Pass onward to the Gomal River in the form of a crescent. Numerous small valleys radiate from either side of the Zhob Valley into the hills, including the Sharan and Khaisoro valleys. With annual rainfall averaging between 125 and 500 mm, the district is semi-arid with a temperate climate. About 4 percent of the geographical area is potentially available for cultivation and rangelands are found almost everywhere in the district.

The district is predominantly Pushtun, with most people belonging to the Kakar Tribe. The majority reside in rural areas, the only exception being the towns of Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh that may be categorized as urban. The major economic activity is agriculture, followed by livestock farming, construction and mining. Women are mainly allied workers in agriculture and livestock farming though most of their labour goes unacknowledged.

The potential of the district lies in its strategic geographical location, its people, low population density, natural resources, including rangelands, cultivable land, biodiversity and a range of economic minerals. This has to be balanced against its aridity, occasional droughts, depleting groundwater, poor forest cover, overgrazed and degraded rangelands and rapid biodiversity loss.

Settlements are ill-planned and public social services remain extremely poor or even non-existent with contaminated water supplies, inefficient sanitation and waste management and poor education and health facilities. According to BPRSP estimates, provincial

poverty levels are as high as 47 percent. There is no reason to believe that Qila Saifullah is any different, particularly with a predominantly rural population resident in remote, scattered settlements.

Progress and prosperity in the district will depend, for a large part, on its natural resource base. Socio-economic development and improved standards of living will hinge on the ability to manage natural resources in a sustainable manner. The situation calls for a strategic framework where economic, social and environmental imperatives are optimally balanced, leading to benefits that are available in the present as well as in the future.

## 1.1 Background

One of the philosophies underlying Pakistan's Constitution is that the federation and provinces are obliged to encourage LG institutions. LGs have existed in one form or another shortly after Pakistan became independent. But the LG system put in place in August 2001 is substantively different as it is based on the principle of subsidiarity that requires the lowest competent authority to handle issues with the centre having a subsidiary function. As such, the central authority performs only those tasks that cannot be dealt effectively at the local level.

This new system of governance was given priority and protection under Article 140-A of the Constitution that reads: "Each province shall, by law, establish a local government system and devolve political, administrative and financial responsibility and authority to the elected representatives of the local government."

Following the promulgation of LGO 2001, each provincial government developed its own local government ordinance. The BLGO came into force on August 14, 2001, to establish, reconstruct and regulate local governments in the province. The provincial ordinance devolved political power and decentralized administrative and financial authority to the LG for good governance, effective service delivery and transparent decision making through institutionalized participation of people at the grassroots level. This is possible only when local governments have a thorough



Typically practiced Sailaba (floodwater harvesting) system in the foothills

understanding of the state of development in their district to establish priorities in different sectors and effectively allocate financial resources through a participatory, transparent and accountable system.

In order to fulfil their responsibility, the LG needs a framework for development planning and implementation or a 'vision' for their future. BLGO has stipulated who and what role should be played by the different tiers of the local government in developing and monitoring this vision. As head of the district government, the zila nazim assisted by the DCO is empowered to provide a vision for district-wide development and direction to ensure efficient functioning of the district government. At the second level, the district nazim, together with the district government is tasked with developing strategies and timeframes for the accomplishment of goals approved by the Zila Council.

The functions and powers of the Zila Council include the approval of long- and short-term development plans. The council requires the district government to undertake measures for good governance and improvement in delivery of public services.

Finally, the Zila Mushavirat Committee that is headed by the zila nazim and comprises the naib zila nazim and all tehsil/town nazims is supposed to interpret the vision for the integrated development of the district, prioritize and co-ordinate inter-tehsil development plans, resolve intra-district disputes, muster resources for crisis management and set the direction for realizing the district's economic potential.

This emphasis on a 'vision' is meant to mobilize people throughout a district to achieve common goals. A true vision, the BLGO asserts, needs to be shared by the majority of the people to facilitate participation at all levels of governance.

That said, the BLGO is not the only reason for developing a vision. Over the last decade, there have been national and international initiatives that have advocated the need for holistic sustainable development planning through participatory local-level governance.

Approved by the federal cabinet in March 1992, the NCS underscores the need for sustainable development in the country. The NCS adopts the globally acknowledged

definition of sustainable development coined by the World Commission on Environment and Development, popularly known as the Brundtland Commission, as “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.”

The emphasis placed by the NCS on its implementation at the provincial level paved the way for the BCS that was approved in 2000. The BCS recommends a strategic plan designed to continue socio-economic development in the province based on sustainable use of natural resources. Between the development of the NCS and the BCS, the SPCS and NASSD were conceived and approved. The experience gained from developing these sustainable development frameworks were put to use in formulating the district conservation strategies or IDVs for Chitral, Abbottabad and Badin districts.

But the urgent need to integrate environmental sustainability into traditional socio-economic development has not been limited to these strategies alone. Key national policies and plans such as the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) address environmental issues.

Additionally, the 2005 National Environmental Policy was framed to achieve the goals of sustainable development.

On the international front, efforts to incorporate environmental imperatives into development planning gained momentum due to two important events. In September 2000, all member states of the United Nations unanimously adopted the Millennium Declaration, agreeing to realize goal eight of the MDGs by 2015 to ensure environmental sustainability. Similarly, the World Summit on Sustainable Development in 2002, resolved to strengthen the concept of sustainable development and highlight the environment-natural resource-poverty nexus. Several priority areas were identified under the acronym WEHAB, including water and sanitation, energy, health, agriculture, biodiversity protection and ecosystem management that countries should work on for the next decade.

## 1.2 Process

The most important feature of developing the Qila Saifullah IDV district was the broad-based



IUCN Pakistan

District Nazim and other senior local government staff enjoying tea after a meeting on IDV



District Council session for approval of IDV in progress

consultative process involving all stakeholders. The process started in May 2006 with a workshop launched by the zila nazim and attended by all key stakeholders.

Next, a series of consultations at the union, tehsil, district, provincial and federal levels were held to seek information on key issues, their priority and development potential, relevant ongoing and future initiatives, available options and possible strategies and measures. Effort was made to meet a broad spectrum of people, including decision-makers and planners (politicians, religious leaders, tribal elders, zila and tehsil nazims), government agencies (district administration, provincial and specific federal government departments), CSOs, the private sector and representatives of academia and media. The management and staff of on-going programmes and projects in the district were also consulted.

The proactive participation of people during the consultations led to the identification of core areas of concern and suggestions for short-, medium- and long-term measures towards their remediation. These suggestions together with important lessons learned from

past programmes and projects in the district and province as well as the experiences of current federal and foreign-assisted projects, particularly those supporting devolution and decentralization, were all considered.

Simultaneously, a comprehensive search for data and information on the district was initiated, covering traditional published sources, non-published material as well as web-based documentation. Meetings were held with individuals from the district government and private organizations to obtain current data on specific sectors.

The result was two draft documents: *QSSoED* and the *QSIDV*. Both were shared with stakeholders in the district before being finalized and approved by the Qila Saifullah Zila Council.

The unique characteristics of the district in terms of its geography, people, socio-economic and environmental conditions are described in detail in the *QSSoED*. The *QSSoED* analyzes the situation existing in the district and its natural resource, economic and social sectors through the lens of governance, poverty reduction, human capital development

and environmental sustainability to identify strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats. The *QSSoED* provided an opportunity to identify problems at the district level, recognize cross-cutting issues and articulate the perceptions of local people. The *QSSoED* also demonstrated the principle of participatory planning as people usually not involved in project and programme development provided their input about priorities and suggested solutions based on their experiences.

The concerns and possible solutions articulated by the people are captured in a framework for the future that identifies priority sectors, recommendations for their sustainable development and the investment needed to resolve these multiple and complex issues. As such, the IDV is the people's vision of their future, the quality of life they would prefer and progressive milestones they would like to achieve en route to realizing their goal.

The framework is organized according to the priorities identified by people. It is in 'blocks', the first four being governance, development needs, the natural resource base and the potential for economic development in the district. The following three blocks are on information and communication, future projects and programmes and implementation arrangements.

The IDV is a way of capturing local and collective thinking and catalyzing the spirit of collective responsibility and action. Accordingly, the vision charts a path leading to sustainable and equitable development in Qila Saifullah, keeping in mind the poor, vulnerable and marginalized sections of society.

### 1.3 District Vision

Together, the people and Qila Saifullah local government decided on their vision for the future on the premise that: "Qila Saifullah is a district of aware, informed, educated, democratic, peaceful, culture and gender conscious, progressive, honest, clean, healthy, hardworking, capable, efficient, reliable and responsible citizens who are enjoying justice, equity, social services, basic

facilities, sustainable livelihoods, development opportunities, healthy environment, security and enabling conditions to contribute to their and the district's development and prosperity and better quality of life where cultural and natural heritage as well as religious values are preserved, conservation and sustainable use of natural resources is practiced and poverty and illiteracy are history."

The Qila Saifullah IDV provides a framework for economic progress, human capital development and environmental sustainability that requires concerted effort and change, a transformation in the manner in which development is viewed in the district. The main focus of the IDV is on reducing poverty in Qila Saifullah and assisting the poorest of the poor. The IDV also calls for coordination between departments in the district as well as the province and an integrated approach that maximises human and financial resources.

The IDV's trajectory follows four principles used during the consultative process and equally applicable during implementation:

- Consulting with and involving people and communities in planning and development
- Emphasising gender equity in policy, plans and programmes
- Stressing on people and environment-friendly development
- Planning and monitoring development that is integrated and sustainable

The Zila Council, district government and people have taken on the challenge to:

- focus on priority issues and their solutions with a view to long-term benefits
- emphasize continuity in policy making, participatory planning and monitoring
- promote development that is sustainable and considers social, economic and environmental needs
- invest in human capital, particularly women



Tree plantation campaign also marks the commitment for conserving the future environment

- identify income generation opportunities for both men and women to improve livelihoods and reduce poverty
  - conserve and use renewable natural resources sustainably
  - encourage environmental assessment of policies, programmes, plans and projects to avoid, mitigate and compensate for adverse environmental impacts
  - enhance access to information and technology
  - seek examples of best practices in other districts for replication or scaling up in the district
  - facilitate growth and participation of civil society and community based organisations (CBOs) in development
  - support public-private sector partnerships to improve district economy
  - advocate prudent use of financial resources with an emphasis on monitoring the investment impacts
  - raise Qila Saifullah's development ranking in the province by providing better quality of life for people in the district
- The district's priorities are:
- improve governance, institutional and human capacity with an emphasis on promoting collective rather than individual interests supported by strong, effective institutions staffed by competent individuals
  - promote effective, efficient and equitable public services that can provide quality education, health, water supply and sanitation facilities
  - plan sustainable large and small urban settlements with efficient public services, water supply and sanitation amenities, sufficient energy provision and communication infrastructure
  - sustainably managing all sources of water by practising integrated water resource management and increasing water productivity

- encourage agriculture practices that value water by switching to efficient irrigation systems and crops to enhance productivity per unit of water
- manage rangelands sustainably and increase livestock productivity
- increase forest cover and vegetation to meet timber and non-timber forest product needs as well as environmental services
- conserve wild flora and fauna through community-managed protected areas
- increase opportunities for livelihood generation and poverty alleviation through

improvements in the minerals and mining sector, growth in value-added small-and medium-sized enterprises, development of commerce and trade markets for the region and a transport hub

- compile district-level information for decision making and communicating to public by collecting accurate data and information on all sectors and disseminating it widely

It is hoped that the implementation of the IDV will lead to the realization of people's future aspirations.

# Local Governments for Good Governance

**T**he GoP has embarked on an ambitious programme of reforms to accelerate growth and reduce poverty in the country. Governance reforms and devolution of power to local governments are its key features.

Governance is a broad definition covering different aspects of relations between the state and civil society. It refers to a process whereby societies or organizations make important decisions and determine who they involve and how.



Good governance is about achieving desired results in the right way. Governance also means the manner in which power is exercised by governments in the management of a country's social and economic resources. In sum, good governance is the exercise of power by various levels of government that is effective, honest, equitable, transparent and accountable.

Good governance leads to a number of positive consequences, including:

- trust
- clear direction
- positive stakeholder input
- good decisions
- valuable work
- ability to withstand crises
- financial stability

The devolution of power was instituted through the Local Government Ordinance (LGO) 2001, including the BLGO 2001. Reforms in local government institutions must be understood both as a process of strengthening local democracy and providing efficient services for economic, social and cultural development.

The devolution plan is designed to serve the interests of the people by creating an enabling environment for provision of social services and basic facilities, ensuring people's participation, undertaking administrative responsibilities without political interference and making the zila nazim and district administration responsible to the people. The plan also provides checks and balances to safeguard against abuse of authority.

Though the LG system was introduced earlier in Pakistan, it is in line with 12 principles developed by the Commonwealth Local Government Forum and endorsed by the Commonwealth Heads of Governments in November 2005. The Aberdeen Agenda, the Commonwealth Principles on Good Practice for Local Democracy and Good Governance include:

- constitutional and legal recognition of local democracy

- ability to elect local representatives
- partnerships between governmental spheres
- defined legislative frameworks
- opportunity to participate in local decision making
- local government accountability
- local government transparency
- inclusiveness
- adequate and equitable resource allocation
- equitable service delivery
- building strong local democracy and good governance

In addition, Pakistan's model introduced many innovations for empowering people at the local level. These were:

- Allocating 25 percent of development funds at each local government level for CCBs to be spent through the community. This enables greater citizen participation in development and encourages local government to work in closer partnership with the community, helping to ensure sustainable development
- Reserving 33 percent seats for women as well as peasants, workers and minority groups
- Establishing institutions with membership from government, elected representatives and civil society

Over time, these innovations will facilitate responsive leadership, participatory decision making, community stake and efficient, democratic local governments.

## Devolution Issues

There are several aspects of the devolution process that need further fine tuning that has been explored at different forums and studies.



Consultative workshop on IDV development in progress in Qila Saifullah

The main obstacles are lack of fiscal decentralization and adequate managerial powers that are necessary to ensure quality and timely service delivery.

### **Fiscal Autonomy**

Owing to the fact that no fiscal devolution has taken place, fiscal management has not shown significant improvement. Provincial authorities still earmark transfers to programmes they designate, negotiate the amounts of other transfers, impose arbitrary deductions from the divisible pool of funds and, over the medium-term, are invariably dilatory in delivering funds to districts on schedule. By failing to deliver revenue certainty and autonomy in budget preparation, the incentives for effective financial management at local levels is being undermined.

Moreover, budgetary commitments are also made to vertical programmes controlled by federal and provincial agencies over which the districts have no control. A large share of funds for health, education, water supply and sanitation delivered in this manner systematically undermine local government's accountability.

Similarly, development budgets provided to politicians who are permitted to choose how and where to spend funds through provincial departments and agencies such as the Balochistan Development Authority also atrophies accountability.

For their part, districts not only have a weak tax base but also have trouble collecting some of the taxes assigned to them.

### **Managerial Authority**

The provincial governments still have managerial authority over senior staff within the districts as they are responsible for their appointment, promotion and transfer. In contrast, the nazims are only entitled to evaluate staff on an annual basis. The result is that despite being physically located in the districts, most senior district staff do not consider themselves as district employees and are more likely to accommodate provincial political pressures to transfer subordinate staff, a tendency that has considerably weakened their accountability to local elected representatives. The jurisdictional confusion inherent in vertical programmes also undermines accountability at the local

level in the health, education, water supply and sanitation sectors.

The role envisaged for the LG commissions has not been fulfilled. They have no authority to impose a settlement and are mainly seen as provincial loyalists rather than unbiased facilitators of the devolution process. The Balochistan Local Government Commission is weak and unable to resolve conflicts among local governments on the one hand and between local governments and the provincial government on the other. The commission has not assumed responsibility towards capacity building, monitoring and accountability.

LGO 2001 also established formal instruments of oversight over local governments. These include the accounts, monitoring and *insaf* committees and district public safety commissions. While these committees are present in many districts and tehsils, they are of little or no authority.

## Institutional and Human Capacity

LG at all levels lack institutional capacity for development planning, implementation and

monitoring. This problem is compounded by the scarcity of competent senior development planners and managers, particularly in health, finance and planning, community development and women's issues. Poor and incomplete record keeping and minimal use of existing information undermines the performance of institutions and individuals as well as their service delivery.

Basic orientation and training of elected and administrative staff and the provision of adequate facilities and equipment at the lower tiers of LG is badly needed. At the provincial level, while public sector reform programmes are providing support to departments responsible for finance and planning, only sporadic efforts are being made to reorient key line departments that have been most impacted by devolution. Staff of provincial departments may be aware that devolution has substantially changed their role with respect to direct service delivery but few in education, health, water and sanitation or in productive sectors have begun to develop capacity for their new roles in sector policy and standards or technical support and mentoring of corresponding local government departments.



IUCN Pakistan

Coordination between provincial departments and their district counterparts and inter-district local governments also continues to be weak.

## Client Power: Citizen Community Boards

Among the different arrangements for community empowerment are the CCBs, voluntary, non-profit associations of local people at the union council, tehsil and district levels. CCBs are one of the mechanisms created under LGO 2001 to promote community participation in local governance in the hope that it will eventually lead to enhanced service delivery, accountability and transparency.

To date, Balochistan has the fewest numbers of operational CCBs. Several factors responsible for this scenario, including lack of awareness about CCBs, capacity shortage among CCB members and LG at the district, tehsil and union levels, lack of staff and facilities for effective support from LG officers and difficult processes for CCB registration and access to funds. Further complications are that the EDO, Community Development, does not enjoy the same status and authority as senior staff in other departments at the district level or his/her direct counterparts at the provincial level.

## Civil Society Organizations

CSOs have grown in number and influence in the country over the last decade and are playing a positive role in development, particularly in sectors that remain outside the government's ambit. Their presence and effectiveness is crucial, especially in districts where capacity of the local government is weak.

In Qila Saifullah, CSOs have contributed significantly to development. But there are perception problems between CSOs and the religious leadership, particularly over women-related interventions, that will need to be bridged through communication and confidence-building measures.

CSOs can also become long-term service providers. In rural Balochistan, for instance, CSOs have considerable experience with

provision of water supply facilities. LG can tap into this experience by contracting out such services to CSOs. This approach will require LGs to develop capacity to become 'clients' for these sector services and for CSOs and private sector firms to be responsive to LGs as consultants in addition to their emerging role in implementation of provincial programmes.

## Female Representation

Though women have entered formal politics at the local level, there are a significant number of vacant seats, particularly in Balochistan.

## Interventions

The district would strive to improve governance by strengthening the devolution process through advocating for fiscal decentralization and revenue generation and the transfer of administrative authority to local governments. As such, the district would need to focus on institutional strengthening and building capacity to identify, develop, resource, implement and monitor its own programmes and projects. With respect to Qila Saifullah, the district would also need to concentrate on human resource development.

## Short-term

- Capitalize on federal-, provincial-, programme- and project-level capacity for district politicians, administrative staff, members of community empowerment structures and monitoring committees
- Develop deeper understanding of mandated roles at district and tehsil levels
- Improve coordination between three tiers of LG and their units as well as between public and private sectors and CSOs for optimal results
- Provide enabling environment in the district, particularly between key stakeholders in development, the Zila Council, district government, CSOs and *ulema* by encouraging:
  - dialogue between religious leaders and CSOs, facilitated by the district

nazim and religious leaders who have good understanding of role of CSOs in development

- receptivity of religious leaders to progressive ideas and acceptance of CSOs as partners in development rather than as organizations forwarding a foreign agenda
- exchange of information and consultation on programme and project activities between CSOs and religious and political leadership
- cultural sensitivity among CSOs
- LGs and CSOs to open lines of communication regarding programmes, projects and possible roles in implementation. CSOs too need to be supportive of the district government's plans and programmes without curtailing their ability to develop innovative programmes and projects without the LG

□ better coordination between CSOs to avoid duplication of efforts and agreements

- Facilitate religious leaders to act as active, progressive partners in district development
- Encourage members of provincial and national assemblies to support devolution by minimizing interventions

### Medium-term

- Implement all programmes, projects and initiatives through LG, irrespective of funding source
- Advocate commitment to strengthening LG through:
  - federal government's commitment to strengthen provincial role in devolution by setting timeframe for reviewing responsibilities of federal and provincial levels in context of service delivery
  - complete reassignment of province-administered functions to local governments



Mukhtar Azad

- advance commitment to capacity development
- facilitate provincial and LG tax reassignments

## Long-term

- Complete devolution by provincial government as envisaged in the BLGO 2001 to ensure timely and quality service delivery
- Support transparency and accountability in decision making
- Promote equity and justice regardless of gender, ethnicity, caste or social status

- Ensure women's representation and effective participation in LG

## Best Practices in Devolution

Since the promulgation of LGO 2001, all districts in Pakistan have district governments. Some 'best practices' have since emerged at the district and TMA level. These examples need to be assessed to identify practices that could be replicated in Qila Saifullah or adapted to local conditions. (See Table 1 for outlines of these practices)

**Table 1**

Best Practices		
District	Best Practice	Brief Description
Gujranwala	Resource revenue generation by TMA Gujranwala City	Income from local taxes has increased substantially from 36.63 million rupees in 2001- 2002 to 49.26 million rupees in 2002 - 2003 to an estimated 58.31 million rupees for 2003 - 2004. This increase was based on gains through a more efficient collection system as well as an increase in fees.
Lodhran	Component sharing approach to development	A cost-sharing mechanism between LG and communities that led to construction of a sewage system. The district budget provided substantial funds for constructing the main sewers while the entire cost of lane and household drains was covered by community members.
Sialkot	Universal Primary Education	The provincial and district governments, UNICEF, NGOs and the business community are aiming for 100 percent enrolment in schools. Approximately 97 percent of children between 5 and 7 years of age are enrolled in primary school and the dropout rate has fallen from 38 percent to 0.7 percent.
Faisalabad: TMA Jaranwala	Database of existing infrastructure	TMA Jaranwala developed a comprehensive database of existing infrastructure that is being integrated into a GIS for use in preparing a town master plan.
	Women's Resource Centre	Nineteen women councillors of the tehsil council have pooled their individual development allocations to set-up a women's resource centre that will provide shelter to abused women and facilities for embroidery, computer and other industrial training.
	Traffic control	To support local traffic police, the TMA has hired 8 people from a private security agency to help manage traffic and reduce impact of traffic jams.
	Sharing cost recovery	To avail incentives by the Punjab government to TMAs for cost recovery in water and sanitation through waiver of electricity arrears, loan and pension liabilities, provided cost recovery could match expenditure on water supply systems. The water rate in Jaranwala has been increased.
Bahawalpur	Realizing potential of CCB	CCB, Bahawalpur, has substantially improved the sewerage network by building sewers of higher quality at lower cost than those constructed by the Water and Sanitation Department. In the future, the CCB plans to undertake further small-scale projects such as building playgrounds and roads for their locality.
Rahimyar Khan	Innovative BHU management	In order to improve the rural health delivery system in the district, a pilot has been initiated in partnership with the Punjab Rural Support Programme entrusted with BHU management. These BHUs have been organized into clusters of three, each headed by a doctor who is given financial incentives and facilities to improve performance.
Peshawar	City Development Strategy	A CDS sponsored by City Alliance, a global group of cities and their development partners, employed participatory techniques to improve conditions of the urban poor. The CDS provided a pragmatic response to the city district's needs and can be implemented with its current capacities.
Chitral	Chitral Conservation Strategy: The district vision	Chitral was the first district in the country to approve a district vision as required by LGO 2001. This Chitral IDV process followed an integrated approach to development, forging linkages between ecological, economic and social issues that aim to maximize productivity through a decentralized planning process.

District	Best Practice	Brief Description
Karachi	Own Source Revenue	Remarkable efforts are underway to increase OSR. According to CDGK, OSR has increased from 46 percent in 2002 - 2003 to 48.85 percent in 2003 - 2004.
	Monitoring Committees	Functional monitoring committees (MCs) that oversee quality of maintenance and repair work have managed to improve. According to the perception of local NGOs and the media, the health, education and works monitoring committees claim to have increased staff attendance by 20 percent in their respective sectors. This illustrates potential of MCs in enhancing service delivery within the LG system.
	Regularization of urban slums	CDGK is attempting to facilitate the regularization of localities and urban slums in the city by seeking to incorporate the Sindh Katchi Abadis Department under its fold.
	Pollution control	CDGK is keen to establish a department for pollution control under its jurisdiction. To reduce air pollution, CDGK has signed an agreement with Karachi Green Bus Company to operate 300 Compressed Natural Gas-fuelled buses.
	Customer Service Centre	TMA Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town has established a Customer Service Centre to register citizens' complaints in collaboration with Transparency International. An elaborate procedure has been developed to track action taken on complaints and gauge level of customer satisfaction.
Thatta	Securing health and education for girls	School enrolment, particularly for girls, has increased rapidly through incentives such as free books and Tawana Pakistan, a school nutrition programme. This has enabled intervention in the education and health sectors and indirectly on poverty alleviation.
Khairpur	Role of <i>nazimeen</i> in catalyzing service delivery	Khairpur is among the districts pushing community involvement in service delivery. This is largely due to the district nazim, a social activist-turned-political leader with experience in investigative journalism, women's rights, environmental conservation and social uplift. The nazim has been instrumental in the formation and implementation of large-scale CCB schemes and school management committees that are tasked with constructing buildings for shelterless schools and decreasing construction costs without compromising quality.
Bolan	Increasing political participation and development	Bolan District's efforts to enable citizen's access to formal politics have been extremely satisfactory: women's seats in the Zila Council have been filled and women have managed to become members of tehsil and union councils. A UNDP assisted project titled 'Support to Devolution Reforms in Balochistan' is assisting eight UCs in Bolan establish a Participatory Information System with data on village location, public facilities and water points. This data will be verified with that held by the district government before a GIS for each UC is completed. The information is being shared with local NGOs to enlist their assistance in development.

District	Best Practice	Brief Description
Mardan	Managing community information	UNICEF's effort to develop a CIS in Mardan has emerged as one of the main projects supporting devolution in the district. A district's CIS serves as the information hub for line departments and other stakeholders.
Khuzdar	Local government and community partnership to ensure safe motherhood	Sixteen village clusters in remote Khuzdar have shown significant improvements in all major safe motherhood indicators after participating in the Balochistan Safe Motherhood Initiative implemented by the Asia Foundation with USAID support that aims to develop and test community-based solutions to support government reproductive health services.
Jhelum	Broadening the scope of CCBs	The district government, in partnership with UCs and the National Rural Support Program, has launched a project under which CCBs are not only being created but are also being provided on-job training through the implementation of physical infrastructure schemes, including sewers, drains and reservoirs.

Source: Ali, Syed Mohammed, 2004. *Identification of Best Practices under Devolution in Pakistan*. Lahore: CIDA Devolution Support Project. <http://www.policy.hu/ali/Identification%20of%20best%20practices%20in%20devolution.pdf>; National Reconstruction Bureau, Government of Pakistan, Best Practices in LG System. [http://www.mng.gov.pk/mng/media\\_resources/best\\_practices.asp](http://www.mng.gov.pk/mng/media_resources/best_practices.asp)

# Social Sectors

**O**f the four provinces of Pakistan, human development indicators in Balochistan are the lowest. Qila Saifullah is no different. The district was ranked 20th of 27 districts in the province by the 2004 MICS and 15th of 26 districts by the SPDC in 2001. These differences were primarily due to the choice of indicators as the only ones common between MICS and SPDC were in literacy, education and electricity.



MICS ranking was based on seven indicators: literacy (ten years+), net primary school enrolment (five to nine years), adequate water and sanitation facilities, skilled attendant at birth, contraceptive use and households with electricity. Each is a key element of the MDGs and pertains to a major aspect of human development. For its part, SPDC used four indicators: literacy and education, housing quality and congestion, residential housing services and unemployment, applying weights to construct a Deprivation Index.

Social sector services depend on accurate demographic figures which in Qila Saifullah's case remain questionable as they were initially extrapolated from Zhob District. Qila Saifullah's population was 193,550 people in 1998, up from 148,362 in 1981. But the district's average annual growth rate has fluctuated from 5.74 percent between 1961 and 1972 to 8.91 percent between 1972 and 1981 and 1.58 percent between 1981 and 1998, raising questions about its validity. Also, all the census periods have shown a negative sex ratio based on the number of men per hundred women, with 119 percent in the 1998 census versus the national average of 106 percent. This too is a large disparity.

Given that reliable population figures are the basis of any long-term development planning, it is important to improve data collection in Qila Saifullah during the next national population census. This entails raising awareness on the importance of a complete and accurate population count, including the enumeration of women, for development planning and provision of social services leading up to the national census. This would also mean using women enumerators for collecting relevant data, controlling the manipulation of census data by including credible CSOs and their female representatives in the enumeration process and exploring the reasons for the unusual drop in the population growth rate during the last inter-censal period.

Improvements in districts in the education, health, water and sanitation sectors are key not only to achieving poverty reduction as outlined in BPRSP but also making progress towards the 2015 MDGs. The BPRSP uses some indicators that appear as targets in the

MDGs. In light of this, Qila Saifullah should attempt to do the same as a reminder of where the district needs to go to improve social sector services and living standards for its residents.

### 3.1 Education

Education is a prerequisite for sustainable development and as such features among the top priorities in Qila Saifullah. The District Education Plan (DEP) for Qila Saifullah reiterates that a number of studies from all over the world indicate that investing in education, particularly primary education, ensures the highest social returns for countries and their citizens. Education helps raise awareness, develop skills and competencies, facilitate attitudinal change and encourage adaptations and innovations. Education can also empower women and other marginalized groups, including children, to safeguard human rights and promote environmental consciousness, motivation and action.

The educational situation in Balochistan remains poor. MICS estimates that the provincial literacy rate for those 10 years and above is 28 percent against the national average of 48 percent. Moreover, the rural literacy rate at 23 percent is significantly lower than the urban rate at 54 percent, with literacy among rural females at 10 percent in comparison to 33 percent among males.

The state of the education sector in Qila Saifullah mirrors that of the province. MICS put the district literacy rate for those 10 years and above at 22 percent with a large gender disparity between females at 11 percent and males at 31 percent. Only a little more than a quarter or 28 percent of children of primary school age between five and nine years were enrolled in school, though the number for girls and boys was almost the same. The retention rate too was low, with over 87 percent of the population aged 10 to 14 years not completing primary school. Over half the population of the same age group had never been to school, with the number higher for girls than for boys.

In Qila Saifullah, universal access to schools has still to be achieved. Only 81 percent of the villages have a school within the settlement,



Students attending the assembly at a local school

albeit the figure increased to 84 percent when schools within a two-kilometre radius were included (MICS 2004). Also, though schools exist they may not be functional.

The government school network comprises 427 primary, 27 middle and 18 high schools with more boys than girls schools (EDO Education, 2006). Only two colleges service the district in Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh towns while a cadet college is planned for Qila Saifullah Town. There are no women-only colleges.

The lack of boarding facilities for non-residents at the tertiary level has affected both students and teachers, resulting in low enrolment, high dropout rates and absentee teachers. Vocational and technical training institutes are absent. There are some private education facilities: between 2003 and 2004, there were five private schools with 776 students and 48 teachers (GoB, 2005). One private sector institution operates an ICN English Language Centre at Muslim Bagh while the Balochistan-based CSO Taleem Foundation has opened a grammar school each in Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh. There are 76 madressahs or religious schools in the district, 40 and 36 respectively in Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh

tehsils (National Commission for Human Development, 2007).

Of the two tehsils, Muslim Bagh is relatively better off than Qila Saifullah. The District Education Plan placed Muslim Bagh's overall literacy rate in 2003 at double Qila Saifullah's (33.38 percent versus 15.15 percent), with the male rate being two times (44.79 percent versus 22.41 percent) and the female rate three times (20.61 percent versus 6.38 percent) higher. According to EDO Education, Muslim Bagh still had more schools at every level than Qila Saifullah in 2006. The remote rural areas are the most deprived, with Kakar Khurasan in the Loi Band and Badini sub-tehsils being worst off.

National-, provincial- and foreign-assisted projects and programmes have been implemented in the district. The USAID Education Sector Reform Assistance Programme selected eight districts, including Qila Saifullah, for its Whole District Initiative (WDI) launched in 2003. The WDI aims to ensure that virtually all children are accessing and completing an ever-improving quality of primary education within five years. Within the WDIs, UCs were selected for the School

Enhancement Programme (SEP) launched to provide basic facilities, infrastructure enhancements, classroom resources, learning aids, sports and playground equipment and an illustrated library and story books to disadvantaged schools. The priority was to facilitate girls' primary schools and encourage enrolment. SEP was carried out in the Muslim Bagh UC, the entire programme being initiated and completed in 2004. In addition, parent-teacher school management committees have been formed and 288 members trained. The World Food Programme is also providing assistance for the improvement and increase in enrolment of girls in primary education in eight selected districts, including Qila Saifullah.

### 3.1.1 Issues

Qila Saifullah's education sector continues to perform inadequately. The poor literacy rates are due to a number of reasons, including lack of awareness concerning the benefits of education, poor economic incentives for educating children, long distances and lack of boarding and lodging facilities for students or teachers. Also, disparities exist in the number of primary, middle and high schools for girls, impacting on female enrolment and retention.

Lack of basic amenities in schools, teacher absenteeism together and poor teaching and learning materials are some of the other factors responsible for low enrolment in Qila Saifullah. Many schools in the district are functioning without proper buildings or basic facilities such as drinking water, latrines and electricity. As many schools have only one or two teachers, absenteeism disrupts schooling. Teachers too are provided few opportunities for in-service education or incentives to improve their performance.

The quality of education is also questionable but there are no district-level indicators to monitor outcomes in the classroom. The availability and authenticity of information continues to be a problem, particularly in education where the future lies in accurate data on the school-going population to be able to plan ahead.

The private sector has made moderate inroads into the field of education but it seems

to have limited interest, possibly due to a lack of encouragement and financial support from the government.

Gender disparities continue to exist as tribal and cultural norms relegate women to the background. There are significantly fewer schools for girls, no colleges and a shortage of female teachers at all levels. Added to this are income inequities: as household incomes falls, the interest and resolve of parents to educate girls falls rapidly.

### 3.1.2 Interventions

As signatory to the World Declaration on Education for All, Pakistan has affirmed that all children, young people and adults have the right to benefit from education. To this end, it has developed and set targets for literacy, enrolment, retention and gender equality under the Education for All (EFA) National Action Plan 2000 – 2015 and under its ambit the short-term Education Sector Reform (ESR) Action Plan 2001-2004. Equally, Pakistan is committed to achieving MDGs Goal 2 that calls for universal primary education as well as Goal 3 to reduce gender disparities in education. Much more will have to be done by the Qila Saifullah district government to meet the EFA, ESR and MDG targets.

#### Short-term

- Complete implementation of the DEP developed under the ESRA programme
- Increase enrolment, retention and completion and enhance quality of education at all three schooling levels by:
  - establishing new schools and upgrade existing ones to ensure universal access and child-friendly physical environments, with a focus on schools for girls
  - consolidating one-teacher schools into one multi-teacher schools in villages
  - providing incentives to students and parents such as free education, books, uniforms and hygiene kits even stipends to new students to increase enrolment and reduce dropout rates

- offering merit scholarships to girls and boys at the middle, high and intermediate levels, with incentive of higher education in reputable institutions in other provinces
- prioritizing the Kakar Khurasan area for literacy and education programmes
- replicating experiences in education in Muslim Bagh in other parts of the district
- Establish a vocational or technical training institute at Muslim Bagh
- Mainstream *madressahs* by introducing common subjects such as mathematics, science, information technology taught in government and private schools
- Facilitate gender equality in education by encouraging enrolment and retention among girls and improving quality of education
  - Improve access to education for girls by establishing more female primary, middle and secondary schools with basic facilities, including boundary walls and toilets
  - Construct separate sections with toilets for girls in degree colleges
  - Encourage women to become teachers by providing economic incentives, arranging intensive local- and provincial-level training and ensuring security, accommodation and transport. Given shortage of teachers, age and qualification criteria could be relaxed and replaced by intensive teacher training
  - Persuade female teachers to work in remote areas by hiring retired teachers from adjoining districts or provinces
  - Motivate community to recognize education, particularly female education, as a priority and teaching as a preferred profession of high social standing through awareness raising by CCBs
- Build capacity of district education department and government to provide improved education services
  - Appoint teachers on merit as the only criteria for selection
  - Ensure adequate number of trained teachers at all school levels by identifying, recruiting and training local teachers as well as hiring teachers from others parts of the province and providing incentives such as good remuneration, security, accommodation and other facilities to work in rural areas of the district
  - Institutionalize continuous training and support at the local level as well as opportunities for regular provincial- and national-level training
  - Encourage teachers to compete for courses offered by the Higher Education Commission
  - Promote teaching as a career with incentives for attendance and performance
  - Establish or strengthen parent-teacher associations to develop community vision for school improvement, participatory monitoring to reduce teacher absenteeism, partnerships with local government to improve services and assist in educational development intervention possibly with private sector
  - Ensure fiscal transparency by involving parent-teacher associations and CCBs in annual planning

### Medium-term

- Construct adequate accommodation for students and teachers
- Arrange for intensive coaching for young girls and boys during summer breaks
- Reduce child labour by encouraging universal primary education and providing incentives

- Encourage CSOs and private sector institutions to establish additional quality-conscious primary schools or convince others to replicate experience
- Evaluate work, contribution and impact of educational institutions in private sector in improving coverage and quality of education
- Establish and facilitate monitoring system to assess quality of education by setting learning milestones and measuring learning outcomes
- Ensure collection of accurate education data on the district through Census 2008. This could form the basis of a Qila Saifullah Education Management Information System (QSEMIS) to assist in responsible and informed decision making in the district. Quality check mechanisms should be in place to assess the available data on education sector. The information would need to be quality checked and updated on a regular basis. In turn, QSEMIS could feed into the provincial-level Balochistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS).
- Introduce modules on governance, sustainable development, environment and gender in graduate and post-graduate courses and curricula of in-service Provincial Institute of Training and Education
- Improve coordination with provincial education department and federally-funded and foreign-assisted educational projects

## 3.2 Water Supply and Sanitation

### Water Supply

Qila Saifullah depends on groundwater and rainfall for its water needs, with drinking water obtained from open surface wells, tubewells, ponds and springs. Less than half or 45 percent of the district population relies on protected wells, ponds or springs for their drinking water needs and only one-third or 34 percent have adequate access to improved drinking water sources within a 2-kilometre distance or 30-minute walk from their homes (MICS, 2004). This means that in two out of three households the burden for fetching water falls on women and

### Long-term

- Facilitate establishment of vocational and technical training centres by private sector



children. Only 19 percent of households have access to drinking water within their homes.

There are a number of water supply schemes constructed by the Public Health Engineering (PHE) department that provide piped water or public standpipes/taps. Till June 1997, PHE had constructed 52 water supply schemes comprising overhead and community tanks with water supplied through electricity and diesel-operated tubewells, open surface wells and springs. Of the 52 schemes, 48 were operational while the remaining four were not as they lacked operation and maintenance (O&M) budgets and staff. In addition, the Water and Sanitation Cell of the Local Government and Rural Development department in collaboration with UNICEF has installed 160 deep well hand pumps throughout the district on already existing open surface wells to make the task of fetching water easier.

BLGO 2001 has vested the responsibility for water supply to local governments. PHE has been devolved to the district government with funding by the provincial department. PHEs are responsible for O&M of all water supply schemes launched before 1992. Schemes after 1992 are the responsibility of the community.

### 3.2.1 Issues

Adequate access to drinking water is not the only issue faced by the district. Currently unknown water quality also needs to be assessed. In rural areas, there is potential for contamination from pumps as well as the mother well that are generally open to the air where the karez system is in use. Piped water can also be contaminated due to corrosion in the water distribution network, cross-contamination from nearby sewers or from stagnant water sources. Similarly, ground and surface water can be polluted by sewage, agro-chemicals and mining leachates such as asbestos.

Also, while the focus is on improved sources and access to water, the quantity of water may be insufficient to fulfil all household needs.

### 3.2.2 Interventions

Safe drinking water is a basic human need, impacting on family health and livelihoods. In Qila Saifullah, MICS estimates that 66 percent of the population is without sustainable access to an improved drinking water source (piped water, public standpipe or tap, borehole/hand pump, protected dug well, tube-well, protected spring) within a 2-kilometre distance of the household. If MDG 7 to “ensure environmental sustainability” and target 10 to “reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water” is to be met, much more requires to be done.

#### Short-term

- Facilitate adequate access to improved drinking water sources in urban and rural areas through additional water supply schemes focusing on overhead tanks in urban areas and large villages and construction of protected tubewell delivery tanks elsewhere. In the Kakar Khurasan area, where groundwater is within 15 metres of the surface, hand pumps can be installed.
- Ensure all people in an area can access source of drinking water
- Support media and other stakeholders to raise public awareness concerning the need to protect drinking water sources, health-related consequences of unsafe drinking water and possible solutions

#### Medium-term

- Ensure sufficient investment to provide improved drinking water sources close to points of consumption within a 2-kilometre distance of households

#### Long-term

- Assess potential and feasibility of supplying water from Zhob River and its tributaries for villages with more than 20 households within close proximity
- Encourage sustainable monitoring of water quality

## Sanitation

Sanitation is poor across the entire district of Qila Saifullah. According to MICS 2004, only 7 percent of households have sewage facilities while the remaining population uses open places and 1 percent of households have a way of properly disposing waste water.

In the urban centres of Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh towns, most households have dry latrines while a few have flush systems. Household sewage discharges into drains in some areas but can be seen flowing in streets in others as there is no sewage system. Elsewhere, sanitation systems are virtually non-existent. This places Qila Saifullah among districts with the lowest prevalence of households with adequate sanitary facilities.

The same problems affect solid waste management and disposal. Waste collection and disposal in urban areas is inadequate: waste is burnt, dumped in open spaces or thrown into drains and watercourses. There are no municipal landfills, composting facilities or markets for recyclable materials.

Like water supply, sanitation and solid waste collection became the responsibility of local governments under BLGO 2001. Solid waste management in both rural and urban areas of the tehsil is now the responsibility of TMAs.

### 3.2.3 Issues

The district has poor sanitation and solid waste disposal management practices and remains without a single wastewater treatment plant. Most people use open places as sanitary facilities. Where facilities such as septic tanks, flush toilets and pit latrines are available, there is no sewage system. There is ineffective collection and removal of solid waste, including the perennial issue of used plastic bags that litter the landscape and are difficult to dispose off.

### 3.2.4 Interventions

Serious efforts need to be made to increase the proportion of the population that has access to improved sanitation.

#### Short-term

- Encourage media and other stakeholders to raise awareness concerning personal



Mukhtar Azad

Solid waste management, a call for action for the local government and general public

hygiene and adequate disposal of human waste to avoid diseases, including diarrhoea, hepatitis, malaria and polio

- Encourage CCBs and CSOs to raise awareness of the need for adequate sanitation facilities and assist in building improved latrines on self-help or communal basis
- Involve CCBs and CSOs in development of small community-driven sanitation schemes for construction of drains and sewage lines and disposal of solid and hospital waste
- Replace use of plastic bags with recyclable cloth bags

### Medium-term

- Provide financial assistance to low income groups for building household latrines
- Install open drains in small settlements and sewer systems with a treatment plant in big villages and towns
- Facilitate joint management of solid waste through household segregation and disposal at designated points for collection, transportation and disposal in designated landfills by TMAs
- Develop market for recyclable materials through support of TMAs

### Long-term

- Encourage use of treated wastewater for the irrigation of urban parks, tree plantations, orchards and crops
- Advocate municipal solid waste management practices through composting of biodegradable waste and recycling of usable items such as paper, glass, plastic and metals
- Construct sanitary landfills for municipal solid waste disposal

## 3.3 Health

Health statistics are not available at the district level even though Balochistan Health Management Information System (BHMISS) has been set up.

That said, health services in general are poor in Qila Saifullah, particularly for women.

The public sector health infrastructure comprises 3 Rural Health Centres, 18 BHUs, 11 civil dispensaries, 1 tuberculosis clinic and 1 mother and child health centre providing primary healthcare, including community health programmes, emergency medical services and treatment of minor diseases. The District Headquarters Hospital at Qila Saifullah and Civil Hospital Muslim Bagh provide secondary level healthcare such as specialized health services, treatment for major ailments and hospital beds. The Rural Health Centre at Badini also provides bed facilities.

Primary healthcare facilities do not have sufficient medical or paramedical staff to provide adequate services for the people. The same is true at the secondary level with posts lying vacant even at the District Headquarters Hospital.

Males outnumber women doctors and nurses and lady health visitors (LHV). This situation has resulted in inadequate health services for women in Qila Saifullah where cultural norms restrict mobility and stipulate that they be treated by women at a women-only facility.

Reliable maternal mortality figures for the district are not available. MICS estimates that while some women may receive healthcare, very few receive trained care. Less than a quarter of pregnant women or 23 percent consulted any health worker for antenatal care and only 10 percent consulted a skilled health worker. Approximately 53 percent of the women had their deliveries assisted by any health worker and around 11 percent by skilled birth attendants. Postnatal care is provided to only 26 percent of the women by any worker and to 10 percent by skilled workers. Only 6 percent of the women were visited by a LHV.

Family planning is also negligible, placing Qila Saifullah among those districts in Balochistan where less than 10 percent of the married population uses modern contraceptives. In 1998, the population density in the district was 28.3 people per square kilometre, much lower than the national average of 166.3 per square kilometre. Population growth accompanied by lifestyle changes among people impact per capita share of benefits from natural resources, food, social services, basic facilities and resources for development.

Infant mortality rates for Qila Saifullah District are also not available. MICS provided figures for 'regions' with Qila Saifullah falling in the Loralai Region. The region's Under-Five Mortality Rate is 190 per 1,000. The Infant Mortality Rate is 121 per 1,000 live births. These rates are higher than those of Balochistan or its rural areas. In Loralai, 55 percent of children less than five years of age were underweight according to World Health Organization standards, with any figure over 30 percent indicating a serious public health problem.

The Expanded Programme on Immunization Survey in 2001 discovered that 31 percent children between the ages of 12 and 23 months were fully immunized (BCG, measles,

three DPT/OPV), 29 percent were partially immunized and 40 percent were not immunized at all. Malaria and tuberculosis are major problems and awareness of HIV/AIDS remains poor.

Several federally-funded 'vertical' preventive programmes are operating in the district. These include the Expanded Programme on Immunization, Mother and Child Health Services, Malaria Control Programme, Tuberculosis Control Programme and Diarrhoeal Disease Control.

### 3.3.1 Issues

At the primary healthcare level, some units and dispensaries are not operational for a number of reasons such as staff absenteeism, lack of buildings, furniture, equipment and supplies. For their part, medical and paramedical staff is unwilling to be posted to the district with even senior specialist doctor positions remaining vacant at the district hospital in Qila Saifullah Town. The district appears to provide an unattractive working environment and insufficient incentives to overcome perceived difficulties. There is a critical shortage of women health workers who are either not available or willing to serve in remote rural areas where there are



IUCN Pakistan

problems such as transport and accommodation.

Even the health services provided are unsatisfactory with a focus on curative rather than preventive measures. Moreover, the coverage of the community healthcare programme is poor, with most of them not performing adequately. As for the paramedical staff, they need more training and awareness to reduce unsafe practices, improve service levels and health outcomes.

Qila Saifullah District has poor healthcare for women and infants. There is a lack of adequate, skilled care at the antenatal, birth and post-delivery stage where LHV coverage remains low. Access to food, immunization programmes and good healthcare is also not available for infants and young children.

The disposal of waste from hospitals in the two towns has not been addressed by the district government and can lead to serious health and environmental issues. Though no details on the volume or composition of waste are available, it is treated as ordinary solid waste and disposed off in the open.

The problems in the district are compounded by its geographical location and long, porous border with Afghanistan. Qila Saifullah hosts a large numbers of Afghan refugees who have brought a number of communicable diseases, particularly tuberculosis, with them into the district.

### 3.3.2 Interventions

Substantial investments will have to be made to achieve MDGs related to health: Goal 4 on child health, Goal 5 on maternal health and Goal 6 on HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases.

#### Short-term

- Advocate preventive healthcare, including awareness, immunization and hygiene practices
- Improve primary and secondary healthcare facilities by ensuring cleanliness, providing safe drinking water and separate toilets for males and females
- Subsidize healthcare costs for the poor by arranging for medicines and surgical facilities for free or at nominal cost
- Provide antenatal care and medication for pregnant women at health centres
- Involve CCBs in selection and training of female medical and paramedical staff to counter cultural taboos regarding female employment
- Streamline recruitment process to enable staff to be hired for sanctioned posts, particularly at senior level
- Create enabling environment and offer incentives to motivate medical and paramedical staff, especially female, to work in remote rural areas

#### Medium-term

- Encourage women to become LHVs and paramedical staff, initially in urban and semi-urban settlements and then in rural areas by convincing parents and the community to view work by women as positive contribution to public good
- Consolidate healthcare facilities in remote rural areas such as Kakar Khurasan to serve dispersed communities. A fully functional Rural Health Centre equipped with staff, buildings, drugs and supplies could service a larger area instead of a number of inadequate BHUs and dispensaries
- Ensure safe disposal of hospital waste by constructing an incinerator at Muslim Bagh or Qila Saifullah or organizing incineration at Quetta
- Spread HIV/AIDS awareness to control risks of infection, improve detection of tuberculosis and increase access to treatment, contain malaria by timely detection and treatment and combat childhood infectious diseases through expanded immunization programme

#### Long-term

- Facilitate practice by paramedic and medical staff

- Support trained homeopathic and herbal medicine practitioners, especially in remote areas
- Build confidence in healthcare facilities at the grassroots level to reintroduce family planning programmes
- Control and improve management of communicable diseases and health risks, particularly among vulnerable groups such as Afghan refugees
- Improve coordination on health policy with provincial health department and project/programme planning and finances with federal government and foreign-assisted projects

### 3.4 Gender and Development

Balochistan's social indicators clearly highlight the prevalence of gender inequalities in terms of low literacy and high maternal mortality rates, low labour force participation by women and unequal sex ratios with more men than women in the population.

Women's access to social services and other infrastructural facilities is limited due to restrictions on their mobility. The tribal culture of Balochistan where decision making is a male prerogative and patriarchy a norm invariably marginalizes women. Traditions also link women's sexuality to concepts of honour, further limiting their ambit that results in reduced employment and income and little participation in community institutions. A patriarchal bias has also led to underinvestment for women-specific development needs.

The situation is the same if not worse in Qila Saifullah where a strong patriarchal social structure presents a challenge to human development and gender equity. As the status quo prevails, discriminatory tribal and cultural practices remain rampant and women only have a marginal role in critical household, social and political decisions. Further, the custom of *valwer* or bride price, paid by the groom to the father of the bride, has led to scores of young men and women remaining

unmarried and women being treated as a commodity.

The Balochistan government decided to address these issues through the Gender Reform Action Plan approved by the provincial cabinet in July 2004. The plan aims to give women more access to public sector services and greater participation in public sector management and political and economic activities. Foreign-funded programmes are also paying greater attention to reducing gender disparities and encouraging participation of women in a number of ways. In Qila Saifullah, the district government and TMAs have recognized the need to start the process of change by acknowledging female education as a top priority.

#### 3.4.1 Issues

A tribal culture and strong local traditions that favour males marginalize women and limits their space outside the home. This is compounded by the limited exposure of people in the district to the experiences and changes taking place elsewhere in Balochistan and the country.

Women's representation in politics and government in the district is largely invisible. The BLGO-mandated women's seats at the union council, tehsil and district levels are mostly vacant and political party participation remains absent. Women's participation in the electoral process and, in many cases, their vote is the choice of the male members of their families, further reducing their decision making role.

Within the district government, few women are employed in departments other than education and health. The district government also lacks capacity in terms of staff and understanding of gender equity and mainstreaming issues to include gender concerns in their development initiatives.

Women are not a visible part of the labour force in Qila Saifullah even if they assist in agriculture or livestock farming. The 1998 Census put women's participation in the labour force at 1.82 percent compared to 69.18 percent for men. They are extended few

opportunities to expand their economic productivity owing to restrictions on their mobility and low cultural acceptability of women taking paid jobs. Women have significantly less access than men to knowledge, capital and technology, restricting their potential to develop and run micro-enterprises.

Lack of mobility also limits women's access to social services such as education and health with implications for their well being as well as their families.

Women's ownership rights to natural resources such as forests, property and other assets are also curtailed in strong tribal and patriarchal societies. Women have no say regarding their marriages that are often arranged among close relatives to retain physical assets within the family.

### 3.4.2 Interventions

Changes in conservative societies require a process-oriented approach that works within local culture to set in motion a process of change. Both men and women should be targeted and involved to reduce social opposition and minimize the social risk of change for women. Initially, it is usually necessary to operate through the men and community or religious leaders in order to gain the trust and credibility of the community at large. Only once they are willing to cooperate can women be directly targeted.

Particular attention will need to be focused on improving access to education for girls and providing and expanding health facilities by increasing the pool of female teachers and health service providers. Improvement in water supply and sanitation at the household and community level will also benefit women in terms of health and hygiene and reduction in time and effort spent on these chores. Both supply- and demand-side constraints on the access of women to basic services need to be addressed as this would free women and young girls for education, income-generating activities or caring for their own and their family's health. Energy is another issue that impacts women negatively and energy projects need to be designed with women's needs in mind.

Women's participation in the labour force will also need to be gradually increased by awareness-raising and access to knowledge, physical and financial assets.

### Short-term

- Assist opinion leaders, including politicians, tribal elders, *ulema*, CSO members, academics and media personnel to recognize contributions that women make to the economic, social and political lives of their families and communities and of the need to communicate this importance to people in the district
- Encourage women's participation and employment, particularly in the education and health sectors
- Apply tools such as gender checklists to integrate relevant concerns in district-level development planning and budgeting, execution, monitoring and evaluation in key sectors such as education, health, water supply and sanitation, agriculture, livestock, forest nurseries, small- and medium-sized enterprises and energy

### Medium-term

- Enlist assistance of opinion leaders in highlighting position accorded to women in Islam, their rights and responsibilities over customs such as *valwer*, marriages to settle rivalries and denial of inheritance
- Improve female access to education by increasing secondary schools for girls and providing incentives such as scholarships or food packages for girls to complete their middle, high or intermediate education
- Improve healthcare facilities by providing incentives such as accommodation and transport to female health providers, including doctors, nurses, LHVs and paramedics and financial support for LHV training and establishing private women-run practices
- Address women-related water supply and sanitation concerns

- Address concerns of women in any energy development plans or projects
- Collect gender-disaggregated data to monitor and evaluate effectiveness of gender and development initiatives
- Ensure new policies and strategies are gender sensitive, address cultural and traditional discrimination and benefit women fully

### Long-term

- Improve women's access to livelihood opportunities and assets by supporting enterprise development and access to microfinance, education and training, market information and markets
- Increase women's access to natural assets and role in natural resource management and conservation
- Support women's role as decision makers in community affairs and local-level governance as a necessary step towards improving political representation
- Build capacity of women councillors to understand and participate in development planning, implementation and monitoring

## 3.5 Settlements and Housing

Most of Qila Saifullah District is rural with only 6 percent being counted as urban (MICS, 2004). Muslim Bagh and Qila Saifullah towns are the only urban areas while other large settlements include Babu China, Kan Mehtarzai, Ghut Teza, Ragha Bakalzai, Kazha, Datobah, Rod Jogizai, Tubli, Tanishpah, Ghorizai, Alikhel, Badini and Kashatoo. Settlements have also started mushrooming along the National Highway or N-50 in Zhob Valley as ribbon development is common along arterial roads.

Settlements in the district have grown organically instead of being systematically planned. Even in the two towns, that have grown considerably, there has been little

urban planning and zoning. Consequently, there are problems in providing social services and basic facilities, including drains and road lighting. Vehicular transport is disorganized and there is traffic congestion in the two towns. The few leisure facilities available have not been well planned and are generally inaccessible for women.

As per MICS estimates, most of the population is not covered by utility services such as electricity, gas, water, telephone, television and internet that are generally restricted to towns and large settlements along the Zhob Valley road. Electricity is provided to 40.3 percent of the population, mainly in Zhob Valley, but load shedding remains common and natural gas is unavailable in the district. Telephone coverage is a mere 1.7 percent. MICS revealed that 55.9 percent of the population does not have utility or information services. If these services are used as an indicator of poverty, over half of the district can be deemed poor.

Settlements do not suffer from any major pollution problems. Air pollution is not a serious problem in the district except along the portion of the N-50 passing within the limits of Muslim Bagh and Qila Saifullah and in areas where heavy transportation vehicles have to scale heights as in Kan Mehtarzai. Pollution is an issue in localized areas in Muslim Bagh Tehsil where chromite and magnesite mining is taking place and in places that have asbestos mines. Air pollution is a major problem in small unit houses where firewood is used for cooking and heating. One-room houses are particularly vulnerable as are women and children. Groundwater pollution is limited to areas where untreated sewage is drained.

Only 1 percent of housing in the district is *pucca*, with brick used by the more affluent in the rural areas and reinforced cement concrete housing now in vogue in urban areas. But the majority of houses are of mud with mud-plastered or thatched roofs.

According to the 1998 Census, two-thirds of houses in both rural and urban settlements consist of two to four rooms, with marginally more one-room houses in the rural areas of the district. At 7.8 people versus 6.9, the



Bird's eye view of the Qila Saifullah Town

number of people per housing unit was more in the urban than rural areas, suggesting settlements are beginning to get congested.

### 3.5.1 Issues

A lack of regional or town and urban planning in Qila Saifullah has resulted in irregular and unplanned settlements. At present, this is not a major problem given the rural nature of the district. But it will become one as the size of present settlements grows and urbanisation increases.

Ribbon development has already started along N-50 and is bound to escalate due to infrastructure development planned for the district, including the upgrading of the national highways and broad-gauge railway, as planning controls are weak or non-existent. Such growth along arterial roads leads to a multitude of development and traffic problems that are costly to resolve in human and financial terms.

The urban centres of Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh are already congested. Water supply and sanitation and public utility services are not provided or managed well in these towns and

further growth would lead to even worse standards of living. Other settlements have few amenities and haphazard construction has made the provision of social and utility services all the more difficult.

There is also the problem of supplying services to remote and sparsely populated settlements scattered in a mountainous area. Long distances and dispersed settlements make service delivery financially unfeasible, leaving people without access to utilities and adequate energy supply.

Housing quality is poor with one-third of the population still housed in one-room units of poor construction, increasing their vulnerability to disease and disasters such as earthquakes.

### 3.5.2 Interventions

The state of affairs in Qila Saifullah District offers the opportunity of planning urban settlements by transforming big villages into towns or establishing planned mid-sized towns to attract households from sparsely located villages existing in uninhabitable conditions where service delivery remains an

uphill task. With town planning guidelines in place, urban master plans can be used to manage the growth of cities while zoning and growth management can be employed to streamline land use and control pace of development, respectively. Also, the long-term view should be taken, with a 50-year vision for settlements in the district.

Urban plans should follow these guidelines:

- Settlements and housing should not be planned on fertile agricultural land
- Green belts should be designed around settlements to contain growth and urban sprawl
- Zoning for different uses such as commercial, residential or industrial should be strictly followed
- Land for services (roads, sewerage, water supply) and utilities (electricity, gas, telephone) should be set aside

### Short-term

- Prioritize and invest in safe drinking water projects, particularly small-scale interventions, with large schemes restricted to big villages and towns
- Involve CCBs and CSOs in the construction of drains and sewer lines and disposal of solid and hospital waste
- Assist in improving quality of housing by encouraging credit facilities for construction
- Reduce air pollution within towns by levying user charges on vehicles that pass through the town such as Muslim Bagh but not on those using the by-pass around the town

### Medium-term

- Install open drains in small settlements and sewer systems with treatment plants in big villages and towns
- Improve services and utilities such as sanitation, solid and hospital waste disposal within existing settlements

and ensure coverage of new settlements

- Encourage joint management of solid waste: household segregation and disposal at designated collection points, transportation and disposal in designated landfills by TMAs
- Encourage public-private partnerships between public sector organizations, private sector, CSOs and local communities to introduce, expand or improve district utility services
- Raise standards of living in towns by improving traffic arrangements, shifting vegetable and livestock markets, slaughter houses, bus and truck stands to commercial zones and phasing out animal-driven carts
- Develop and provide:
  - low-cost earthquake-resistant housing designs
  - guidelines on low-cost quality housing
  - urban plans for mohallas and wards
  - urban plans for small and big villages and towns
- Develop and implement master plans for Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh that chart out growth and development and comprise guidelines for residential, social, religious, recreational, commercial and industrial areas and cover future land use patterns
- Draw up master plans for future urban centres, villages to be converted to new mid-sized towns, new towns planned along national highways and proposed broad-gauge railway line through Zhob Valley
- Devise comprehensive energy sector plan for settlements in Qila Saifullah that address energy concerns of women and possible shift from biomass-based energy to alternative and renewable sources



Roadside venue for a little rest and a meeting/dialogue

## Long-term

- Increase off-grid electricity coverage, particularly for small settlements that are more than 20 kilometres away from national grid and where electrification for the next decade is not planned through installation of decentralized small-scale energy systems powered by renewable technologies using solar photovoltaics, micro-hydro, wind and biogas for small villages and solar thermal systems for larger settlements

## 3.6 Sustainable Livelihoods and Poverty Reduction

In Pakistan, poverty declined until the 1990s. But since then, slow economic growth, low human capital, especially for women, and poor governance have contributed to rising poverty. Poverty was traditionally measured through income disparities but now has been broadened to include other measures of well-being as well. A multi-dimensional approach to poverty implies giving attention to empowerment and reducing livelihood insecurity as well as maximising income growth.

Between 2001 and 2002, all of Pakistan's provinces undertook participatory poverty assessments (PPAs) that tapped views of poor people to poverty and potential strategies to reduce further escalation. Fieldwork was conducted in nine districts in Balochistan, including Qila Saifullah. The poorest union council was selected in the district and within it the poorest and a better-off site was chosen. China Barat Khail and Nali Sar in Batozai Union Council were included in the assessment.

The PPA attempted to understand and analyze the livelihoods of the poor and their access to certain assets or poverty reducing factors. These assets covered natural capital (land, water, forests, marine and wild resources), produced capital (physical infrastructure, tools and technology and credit), human capital (health, nutrition, education, knowledge and skills), social capital (networks and connections, the benefits of patterns of association) and political capital (power or powerlessness). Assessing the assets available or not available to a group of people helps establish the nature of people's mechanisms for coping with poverty and their

vulnerability to extreme poverty. This vulnerability includes external factors such as shocks (economic, human health, conflict, drought and floods), trends (population, resource, national and international economic, political and technological) and seasonal shifts (prices, production, health, employment opportunities).

Finally, the PPA looked at policies, institutions and processes that assist, block or obstruct people's efforts to improve their assets or to transform them into income and other improvements in their lives. These institutions may include elements of the traditional social order, official organizations such as schools and courts and governmental or non-governmental organizations.

The PPA found that poor people all over Balochistan defined poverty as more than a lack of access to financial or material possessions. Their view of poverty included other dimensions such as political (lack of power to make and influence decisions at the household, community and policy levels), cultural (exclusion on basis of gender, ethnicity, caste or religion) and institutional (little or no access to institutions that should provide resources such as education and credit, security and justice) limitations.

Among the findings of the PPA was that the poor rely heavily on resources but access to, and control over, natural assets and resources are skewed against them. This is a fundamental cause and repercussion of poverty. Also, access and entitlements to public state-provided services and assets are tipped in favour of the rich and better-off rather than the real poor.

The Balochistan Report of the Pakistan PPA, completed in 2003, had four recommendations: increase access to, quality of, and control over resources (including natural resources) and assets, reduce vulnerability and provide adequate social protection, eliminate discrimination based on gender, ethnicity or caste and ensure equal access to justice regardless of gender or social status.

These recommendations were accepted by the BPRSP completed towards the

end of 2003. To reduce poverty in the province, BPRSP goals included engendering growth, managing scarce water resources, reforming governance, improving human development and addressing vulnerability to shocks.

## Interventions

### Short-term

- Collect accurate data on labour force and incomes/livelihoods
- Use information technology to disseminate up-to-date information on a variety of issues such as market prices, preventive measures in health, nutrition and sanitation and long-distance education
- Enhance existing micro enterprises such as handicrafts, woodworking, knitting, sewing and jam/jelly production through technological input and economic incentives
- Encourage poultry farming, particularly by women, through provision of stock, training and credit
- Communicate and provide opportunities for people to have first-hand exposure to best practices or successful initiatives demonstrated by CSOs, public or private sector organizations
- Support improvements in local-level development and governance by encouraging social mobilization and formation of CBOs
- Increase access to formal credit facilities, particularly microcredit, for women and the poorest sections of society to support self-employment and micro-enterprise development
- Reinforce livelihood improvement projects and ensure their experiences are disseminated and, if possible, replicated in entire district

### Medium-term

- Develop district SME plan based on analysis of SME sector and potential enterprises that can be established



Investing in children and youth can only ensure sustainable development in the district

- Increase employment opportunities by introducing small- and medium-sized enterprises, encouraging value-added and innovative products and providing better access to markets
  - Invest in human capital by encouraging:
    - Private sector investment in need-based technical training centres and vocational training institutes
    - Enterprise development training needed to establish and operate micro, small- and medium-sized enterprises
    - Technical and vocational training to produce skilled work force
    - Need-based government, private sector or foreign-funded agriculture and livestock related training at various levels through vocational training institutes, technical training centres as well as provincial agriculture and animal husbandry colleges
    - Human resource development for men and women at three levels: local government officers, CSOs and CCBs and SMEs.
  - Ensure merit-based employment in public sector agencies by reducing political interference in selection
  - Improve provision and quality of physical infrastructure such as the road network to avoid physical isolation, increase access to markets and expand employment opportunities
  - Enable access to affordable quality education and healthcare services regardless of gender, caste or social status
- Long-term**
- Settle land ownership issues and define user rights of communities on state- owned lands through focused exercise to reduce communal conflicts and litigation, improve relations between communities and individuals and enhance productivity of land
  - Enhance ownership or access of poor to natural resources and assets such as land, water, forests and livestock

- Reduce vulnerability and provide adequate social protection to the poor through risk reduction strategies (preventive health programmes), impact mitigation (risk of unemployment through provision of vocational training) and coping with impacts (broad-based social safety nets programmes such as Bait-ul-Maal and zakat that are accountable, transparent and efficient).
- Ensure access to fair, affordable justice regardless of gender, ethnicity, caste or social status

### 3.7 Culture and Tradition

In Qila Saifullah, tribal affiliations, customs and traditions still govern life. Traditions are practices or customs passed down from generation to generation. But it has to be remembered that traditions need to be modified, improved or even eliminated altogether, if redundant, with the passage of time.

In the past, changes were slow due to the isolation of people and self-reliance of communities. But in a global world supported by rapid communication, traditions are changing quickly and rigid adherence or resistance is no longer advisable. Communities have to adapt and adjust to altering circumstances and their survival, progress, well-being and prosperity. Of course, positive traditions can be retained but that prevent development need to be discarded.

## Interventions

### Short-term

- Invite credible, experienced and knowledgeable speakers or development practitioners to visit district and engage in constructive dialogue with stakeholders
- Organize exchange visits to other districts in Balochistan and the country and to progressive Muslim states such as Malaysia to demonstrate how constructive change can improve quality of life

### Medium-term

- Expose local tribal elders and *ulema* through formal and informal sessions to new ideas and experiences taking place in the Muslim world and encourage them to play positive role in transition to a more progressive society
- Encourage the ulema to incorporate progressive ideas and real life situations in their sermons
- Convince teachers and media to play their role by apprising people about positive development experiences

### Long-term

- Promote justice based on legislation and Islamic options rather than tribal, non-Islamic customs
- Promote inter and intra tribal harmony

## Natural Resource Base

**N**atural resources sustain life by providing water, air, food and other products for local consumption and trade and are part of complex natural ecosystems that govern life on earth. Rural communities, especially the poor, depend heavily on natural resources for their livelihoods. As environment become degraded and productivity of natural resources decline due to myopic policies, institutional and social failures and natural disasters such as drought, the poor are the most affected. Sustainable management and conservation of natural resources is particularly critical in districts such as Qila Saifullah where most people still live off the land.



The main natural resource issues in Qila Saifullah are:

- extreme aridity and periodic droughts
- a fast receding groundwater table, the result of indiscriminate water mining due to the low cost of pumping water, the inefficient use of water and reduced recharge because of the destruction of vegetative cover
- inappropriate agricultural practices, with irrigated agriculture and fruit orchards replacing arid agricultural practices and livestock farming
- overgrazed rangelands supporting poor quality livestock, the numbers of which exceed carrying capacity of the land
- lack of management of notified state forests and loss of forest vegetation in the countryside
- declining wildlife populations, except in the Torghar Community Conservation Area in the Toba Kakar Mountain Range

## 4.1 Climatic Information

Precipitation in Qila Saifullah is highly unreliable. The mean annual rainfall ranges between 125 and 500 mm, most of it in the form of snowfall in the winter from the western depressions. The average annual rainfall, a 30-year mean, was 261 mm at Zhob. Data from the meteorological station at Zhob has been used to provide this figure as there is no comparable facility in the district. But as Qila Saifullah and neighbouring Zhob have almost similar geographic characteristics, it is assumed that they experience more or less the same rainfall levels. That said, measurements taken at Zhob and applied to such a large area have limited value for agriculture and drought management.

Reliable meteorological data is needed for accurate weather forecasts and patterns in the periodicity and duration of droughts, changes in the monsoons and modelling climate variables. This data and information would be used by the agricultural sector for

water basin management and agencies involved in drought early warning systems for impact mitigation. To generate this data, the Pakistan Meteorological Department and provincial and district governments would have to work together to establish meteorological stations in Qila Saifullah. Considerable variations in rainfall at the local level mean that site-specific data is also needed for which smaller stations would also have to be established. Timely information would then be available to users in an appropriate form.

## Interventions

- Establish at least four meteorological stations, one each at Kakar Khurasan, Muslim Bagh Town, Qila Saifullah Town and a village in the eastern part of the district. Ideally, these stations need to be located at sites selected on the basis of seasonal images captured by satellites and relay data using remote sensing technology. This would enable them to become part of a network of functioning meteorological stations in the province that meet World Meteorological Organization standards of network density and reliable data collection.
- Launch smaller stations to collect site-specific, local-level data in suitable schools/colleges/offices or at any other open places and train staff to collect and systematically report basic data. In remote areas, fully automated stations that transmit data on a regular basis via satellite would need to be set up.
- Disseminate data such as detailed short- (daily/weekly), medium- (monthly) and long- (seasonally) term forecasts among farmers and still longer term information for water basin and drought management authorities

## 4.2 Drought

Extended periods of abnormally dry weather and below average rainfall is not new to Balochistan or Qila Saifullah. The last prolonged drought that lasted from 1999 to 2004 decimated livestock and severely



Arid climatic conditions together with periodic droughts leave the land barren

affected fruit and rain-fed cereal production. Drought differs from other natural disasters in the sense that the effects accumulate slowly over a considerable period of time, are spread over large geographical areas and may linger on for years even after it is over.

In a normal year, pastoralists sell livestock and milk products, the income from these sources being used to purchase wheat for household consumption and other non-food needs. Livestock also provides meat, milk and yogurt for family consumption. It is estimated that up to 70 to 80 percent of the income of the nomadic population is from livestock. During the 1999 – 2000-drought, households lost some 40 to 45 percent of their livestock in Balochistan. As livestock owners had not bred their animals due to lack of water and poor pasture conditions, they did not have the off-take needed for sale. This coupled with fewer animals deprived households of a major source of income. In northern Balochistan, about 60 to 80 percent of fruit trees dried up, with Qila Saifullah among the worse-hit districts.

Drought intensified the dependence on migrant wage labour that increased supply of

labour and in turn resulted in a decline in wage rates. Initially, households absorbed the shock through the sale of livestock, wage employment, borrowing and the relief measures implemented by the provincial authorities. But as the drought continued, household coping mechanisms also diminished. As the consumption of food items such as milk, meat and vegetables declined, the most affected were women and children already suffering from malnutrition and anaemia.

The federal government is in process of setting up early warning systems to reduce the impact of natural disasters, including drought. The National Centre for Drought / Environment Monitoring and Early Warning System in Pakistan has been set-up in the Pakistan Meteorological Department and will form one component of a proposed national Multi-hazard Early Warning and Response System under a National Disaster Management Authority mandated to deal with disasters. Though the BLGO also provides for disaster management at the district, tehsil and union level, the draft Emergency Services Ordinance 2002 has proposed the setting up of district emergency services.

## 4.2.1 Issues

Drought-related meteorological data such as temperature, precipitation, soil moisture, surface run-off, recharge and groundwater availability needs to be collected from many points across Balochistan and Sindh, analysed and regular forecasts issued. Currently, the number of measurement points and data collected is less than optimal and makes accurate analysis difficult. The data required may be extensive but collection can become easy and reliable with the help of remote sensing technology and GIS.

Institutional arrangements for a central disaster management authority with a long-term vision have been planned but have yet to be put in place. The authority will need to have adequate hazard and risks assessment knowledge, technical monitoring and warning systems and the capacity to effectively disseminate warnings to those at risk.

A provincial or district-level drought preparedness and mitigation plan to address long-term issues is also needed. Even with a plan, widely dispersed human and livestock populations, poor communication infrastructure, long distances and few water and feed options make drought-related work difficult.

## 4.2.2 Interventions

Drought is a natural hazard that threatens the lives and livelihood of people not only in Qila Saifullah but in Balochistan, Sindh, southern NWFP and southern Punjab. This means that drought preparedness and management along with other natural hazards such as earthquakes, floods and cyclone has to be coordinated with national institutions such as the Pakistan Meteorological Department, Emergency Relief Cell and Civil Defence, with the provincial agencies as well as the local government responsible for relief measures. Effective early warning of drought promotes improved environmental management and helps increase security of vulnerable populations by shifting emphasis from providing emergency food and other aid to disaster risk management.

### Short-term

- Build capacity of public sector organizations, CCBs, CSOs, private sector, farmers and pastoralists in Qila Saifullah both in drought preparedness and mitigation. This would cover provision of timely information to district and provincial agencies, dissemination of drought warnings, coordination with local, provincial and federal agencies and relief and rehabilitation services

### Medium-term

- Invest in drought preparedness and contingency planning at provincial and district level, including provision for drinking water for people and livestock, feed for livestock, prevention and control of livestock diseases, fodder tree reserves and adjustment strategy
- Plan relief and rehabilitation measures in advance:
  - Build airstrips in remote areas to drop emergency supplies and airlift livestock
  - Encourage sale of livestock which owners cannot afford to maintain and are likely to die through rational market prices, purchases in fields rather than market centres and introducing mobile slaughter and refrigeration vans
  - Ensure provision of seed and recovery packages in the fruit sector, particularly among those who may lose their fruit trees, and extend credit facilities to assist farmers in accessing inputs and support services

### Long-term

- Coordinate with federal government to be part of drought early warning system for Balochistan, Sindh, southern NWFP and southern Punjab that would regularly monitor and disseminate information
- Liaise with provincial government to strengthen GIS facility at Quetta to prepare district-wise climatic moisture and soil moisture index maps

- Establish provincial-level disaster emergency fund to cover drought relief and rehabilitation costs

### 4.3 Land Use

Accurate, detailed information on land and land use is not available in Qila Saifullah. The exact geographical area of the district is also uncertain. The most commonly used figure is 6,831 sq km, of which 39 percent is unreported or needs to be surveyed. The reported and cultivable area figures too may be unreliable.

The area and distribution of rangelands which remains the main land use in the district has also yet to be surveyed and assessed. The same is true for area under forest cover and biodiversity hotspots.

In fact, it is questionable whether any land use planning is taking place in the district. As such, agricultural development may be taking place in areas where it is not economically viable or environmentally suitable given the availability of irrigation water, choice of crops, agricultural inputs and infrastructure. As the district gets more urbanized, decisions will have to be taken on land development for physical infrastructure, housing, energy and water supply and sanitation. This calls for an integrated land use planning process and land use plans that cover a number of sectors.

Qila Saifullah is a semi-settled area with two types of land ownership: communal and personal. The last land settlement record was compiled in 1955 and is still being used for revenue collection and ownership rights (GoB, 1997). Though land ownership may be complex, consolidating and completing the land record and its computerization is urgently required.

### Interventions

- Liaise with Survey of Pakistan to produce GIS map of district and confirm geographical area for development planning and raising fiscal resources as the provincial government allocates resources to districts based on population and area

- Use satellite imagery to develop comprehensive inventory of district land use and natural resources

- Build on GIS district map by adding sectoral and thematic information required by land use planners, district departments, projects and other stakeholders

- Update and computerize land settlement record

- Introduce integrated land use planning, including land evaluation, in new projects and programmes

### 4.4 Water

Water is the lifeline of the district and if used judiciously, would sustain people and the environment. In arid regions such as Qila Saifullah, water shortages are not due to low rainfall as is popularly perceived. Rather, they are the result of overuse and mismanagement of available water as well as lack of capacity for harvesting rainwater and recharging groundwater. The most critical management challenge in arid areas is to deal effectively with short periods of excessive water and flooding on the one hand and long periods of little or no water.

Surface water in Qila Saifullah is in the form of the Zhob River and rainfall. The river flows for about 400 km before discharging into the Gomal and has several tributaries. But the Zhob River and almost all its tributaries are ephemeral. This makes precipitation the major source of surface water in the district.

The Zhob Basin has limited potential for development: groundwater is in balance in the Muslim Bagh sub-basin, in deficit in Qila Saifullah and possibly in limited surplus in Zhob (GoB, 2000). This means that groundwater mining is taking place in Qila Saifullah, with abstraction of water exceeding recharge to the basin.

This situation is due primarily to a large number of tubewells in the district, both government and private, with private electric tubewells outnumbering all others (1,708 out

of a total of 1,888). The number does not include the 160 tubewells being installed under the Balochistan Development Authority's Patab Tube well Irrigation Scheme in Batozai, Sibzai and Ghibzai. Agriculture in the district has become dependant on groundwater with 79 percent of irrigation water coming from tubewells, 2 percent from wells and 19 percent from karez and spring sources.

#### 4.4.1 Issues

The most serious water-related problems in the district include rapid groundwater depletion and inefficient use of irrigation water.

Though the most valuable resource of the district, groundwater is still being rapidly depleted particularly in orchard areas due to over pumping by tubewells. Like elsewhere in Balochistan, the initial government subsidy on tubewells has led to the installation of a large number of wells in the district while the current subsidy on electricity tariff for tubewells has led to the over pumping of water. There are no indications that the development of groundwater will slow down, installations of new tubewells will be better regulated, electricity tariff be revised or

lessons learned from earlier tubewell schemes such as Nasai will be applied.

Implementation of legislation and practical measures are needed to discourage the drilling of new tubewells and regulate groundwater use on the basis of hydrological criteria and groundwater availability, keeping future needs in mind.

The subsidy issue has yet to be resolved even though it is detrimental to water resources and against the principles of equity in distributing public funds. As such, only a small percentage of farmers who are better off and can invest in electric tube wells are benefiting from the subsidy. Pastoralists, farmers practicing rain-fed farming and those using diesel pumps are not eligible for this subsidy and remain deprived of this public benefit.

The groundwater problem is being exacerbated by reduced recharge because of decreasing vegetation cover in the district. Heavy grazing, cutting and removal of vegetation for firewood and inappropriate agricultural practices have resulted in soil erosion with topsoil and nutrients being lost. As fine soil particles are lost and coarse particles increase, desert pavement-like



Mukhtiar Azad

Karezes still provide sustainable source of water for the Qila Saifullah District

conditions prevail at the surface, reducing percolation to depths where plant roots are located and groundwater supplies can be recharged. For instance, the state of karezes in Muslim Bagh, many of which have dried or are suffering from decreased flows, are ample evidence of decreasing groundwater resources.

Precipitation which is not absorbed by the soil or used by plants, flows as surface run-off and drains quickly into streams and tributaries of the Zhob. It neither remains locally available as soil moisture nor adds to the groundwater. Surface run-off in the district is very high due to steep slopes and lack of vegetation. Unfortunately, the construction of check dams, rainwater harvesting and soil and water conservation measures are not practised widely in the district.

Surface water can also be collected through traditional water harvesting practices such as *khushkaba* or rainwater collection and *sailaba* or spate irrigation where floodwater from torrents is used. These too are not being used to their full potential.

Still, it is the inefficient use of water for agriculture that is the most serious issue. Farmers continue to employ poor and inefficient agricultural practices such as flood irrigation even when water is becoming scarce, the population is growing and food needs are on the rise. Ideally, optimal use of limited water should be based on soil and crop requirements instead of traditional use of water based on land ownership and water rights.

#### 4.4.2 Interventions

Qila Saifullah urgently needs to adopt a two-pronged approach to water: integrated water resources management and increasing water productivity.

#### Integrated Water Resources Management

IWRM revolves around four guiding principles from the 1992 Dublin Conference on Water and Environment:

- Fresh water is a finite and vulnerable resource, essential to sustain life, development and the environment

- Water development and management should be based on participatory approach, involving users, planners and policy makers at all levels
- Women play a central part in the provision, management and safeguarding of water
- Water has an economic value in all its competing uses and should be recognized as an economic good

Water plays an important role in agricultural production, sustaining healthy ecosystems and general well-being and livelihood generation. This demands coordinated action. In this context, IWRM is a comprehensive, participatory planning and implementation tool for managing and developing water resources that balance social and economic needs and ensure healthy ecosystems for future generations. IWRM involves applying knowledge from various disciplines and insights garnered from diverse stakeholders to devise and implement efficient, equitable and sustainable solutions to water and development problems.

Over time, IWRM has become universally accepted as a way to manage scarce water resources in a sustainable way. In 2002, the World Summit on Sustainable Development called for countries to develop IWRM and Water Efficiency Plans by 2005 in recognition of the strategic importance of improved water resources management in achieving the MDGs. Since then, the link between IWRM and the MDGs has been strengthened and there has been considerable follow-up.

IWRM requires a highly consultative and participatory process, engaging the community as well as other stakeholders in devising solutions. Qila Saifullah district has experience in consultative development as it was used to develop the district SoED and IDV.

#### Water Productivity

Water productivity links water consumed with outputs produced. Just as 'crop yield' is the productivity of land often measured as tons per hectare, water productivity of the same crop is measured as 'crop per drop' or as

kilograms of rice or wheat per cubic meter of water used.

Increasing water productivity in irrigated and rain-fed agriculture has great potential in an arid region, compared with allocating more water for improving food security and reducing poverty at the lowest environmental cost. Increasing water productivity implies getting *more* crop per drop. For example, if a farmer has a rice field and a fish pond, then the total water productivity combines the amount of rice and fish produced per unit of water consumed. At the river basin level, water productivity needs to be defined beyond increase in crop (grain and fodder) to include livestock (meat and egg) and fishery yields, ecosystem services as well as social impacts such as health expressed as economic return, environmental services or nutritional value.

In Qila Saifullah, measuring productivity per unit of water is important as water rather than land is the limiting factor.

### Short-term

- Raise awareness and knowledge of IWRM, the concept of improved productivity per unit of water and the need for high-efficiency irrigation
- Rationalize use of agricultural tubewells to reduce groundwater mining and encourage more productive use of water
  - Restructure agricultural tube well subsidy. Savings from tube well subsidy could be used to introduce schemes for efficient water use. Also, the higher cost of pumping at more realistic energy prices may lead to less water loss
  - Regulate installation of new and replacement tubewells and ensure EIAs of new public sector tubewell schemes are conducted as ignoring environmental impacts can lead to failed projects
- Build small delay action and check dams that either increase recharge to groundwater or store water in small reservoirs

### Medium-term

- Adopt IWRM in water sector development projects to improve economic and water use efficiency in all sub-sectors of water use
- Encourage agricultural productivity to be expressed as crop yield per unit of water applied rather than unit area
- Improve on-farm water management and irrigation efficiency through land levelling, zero tillage and technology-intensive irrigation methods such as drip, bubbler, sprinkler, spray and low energy precision application irrigation. These systems can be introduced and popularized through subsidies, easy availability of materials and technical support, demonstrations and trainings
- Increase water conservation by identifying suitable crops and soil-plant-water relationship for optimal application of water
- Promote plant cover to increase groundwater recharge
- Introduce and popularize technologies for artificial recharge of groundwater
- Construct check dams in upper reaches of streams to enhance percolation of seasonal floodwater that normally flows away to provide moisture for small tree plantations
- Broaden mandate of District Water Management Committee beyond tubewell monitoring to all aspects of water conservation and use in the district

### Long-term

- Develop appropriate waste water treatment systems that would allow waste water to be biologically safe for reuse for agriculture
- Reorganise, improve and increase number of spate irrigation systems according to water availability and soil types



Typical fruit orchard in Qila Saifullah – the main agricultural activity

## 4.5 Agriculture

Agriculture is the mainstay of Qila Saifullah's economy for a number of reasons. The district has 'virgin' soils that have good potential for agriculture, provided there is water or adequate rainfall, the climate is dry and there is ample sunshine. This makes the area suitable for production of all kinds of deciduous fruits and for early and late winter vegetables and other crops. The highest earnings are from tomato (about one-third of the value of total agricultural produce), followed by almond, apple and apricot.

Water is the main constraint for agriculture in Qila Saifullah. Land is irrigated by groundwater available through karezes, open surface wells or tube wells or surface water collected through traditional water harvesting practices such as *khushkaba* or *sailaba* irrigation. The use of groundwater for irrigation has increased over the years though water harvesting techniques continue to be used in areas where groundwater is unusable, unavailable or has to be pumped from extremely deep aquifers.

Most produce such as fruits, onion, potato, chillies, tobacco, vegetables and fodder is cultivated on irrigated land. But some crops, including wheat, jowar, barley, maize, cumin, pulses, melons and certain fodder species are cultivated using both ground and rain water. Fruit orchards have to be groundwater irrigated to be commercially viable. Time series data reveals that total yield of agricultural and horticultural produce has been increasing over the years due to an increase in area rather than yield, as average yield figures have remained more or less constant. The use of fertilizers is limited but mechanisation has increased, with private ownership of agricultural machinery now outstripping government-owned tractors and threshers even though bulldozers and reapers continue to be public-sector owned.

Farm sizes are generally small: 77 percent of land-holdings are less than five hectares while only 4.1 percent of farms are larger than 20 hectares (GoB, 1997). In areas not irrigated by groundwater, the size of land holdings is supposed to be relatively large but no further information is available. Tenancy is not very common but some large land and orchard owners do employ tenant labour.

Women are not directly involved in agriculture but in allied agricultural activities such as grain storage and manure collection. But their labour is unpaid and remains unrecognized.

Agro-forestry or tree planting on farmland is not a common practice as it is seen to compete with land for orchards and pastures.

### 4.5.1 Issues

Groundwater continues to be used for agriculture even though it has led to groundwater depletion and even mining in areas. Nor has the experience gained from earlier tubewell schemes such as Nasai been applied in the design of new initiatives.

The preference for tubewell-irrigated agriculture has resulted in inefficient, unsustainable use of groundwater at the expense of *khushkaba* and *sailaba* farming systems. As a result, their contribution to groundwater recharge has fallen while the potential of these water harvesting practices to supply additional water for agriculture is being ignored.

Excessive, ineffective irrigation practices are still in vogue and high delta fruit, vegetable and other crops continue to be grown over large areas. All this has led to falling water tables and drying up of karezes. But farmers are still reluctant to use more efficient technology-intensive irrigation systems, switch to low delta crops or fruit trees, use greenhouses for cultivation of high-value off-season vegetables or engage in organic farming. Land resources are being managed inadequately, resulting in loss of fertile top soils, declining fertility and deteriorating soil structure due to poor agricultural practices.

Land evaluation for agriculture, including interpretation of surveys of climate, soils, vegetation, surface and sub-surface drainage and other aspects of land, using remote sensing and GIS technologies has not been carried out. Agriculture needs to be planned according to seasonal availability of water. Winter and summer rainfall data are far more important for crop choice, planting dates and other agricultural activities than annual average precipitation. Accurate data on local

climate and precipitation are needed but are also not available. The same is true of soil classification surveys focusing on water holding capacity and fertility are also important to manage prime agricultural lands under high value crops. Mapping of surface drainage of the entire area would help in planning appropriate sites for delay action dams. Sub-surface drainage is not a problem in the district except in a small area in Muslim Bagh Tehsil where drainage is impeded. The soil survey would assist in identifying the areas that need appropriate treatment for agricultural use.

There is no local market for fruits and vegetables and farmers have to depend on markets outside the district. Nor have agro-based SMEs been introduced to produce value-added products and improve livelihoods. Accessing agricultural credit is also difficult for poor farmers despite the presence of banks in the district.

Women's contribution to agriculture is not acknowledged. Moreover, they are unable to own land or access agricultural information and credit.

### 4.5.2 Interventions

#### Short-term

- Raise awareness and knowledge of modern agricultural technology, including efficient irrigation systems, greenhouse cultivation and organic farming
- Promote cultivation of tomato and other vegetables, including off-season production, for high returns
- Encourage apiculture and honey production, especially in orchard areas

#### Medium-term

- Facilitate cultivation of medicinal plants, both local and from other parts of the province or country
- Maintain top soils in agricultural lands by encouraging zero tillage and use manure and fertilizers to improve soil fertility and water holding capacity

- Expand scope of agriculture by promoting and supporting water harvesting systems, especially in foothill areas
- Increase productivity in rain-fed areas through enhanced management of soil moisture and supplemental irrigation where small water storage dams are feasible
- Improve yield per unit area through promotion of optimal use of water, agricultural inputs and improved agricultural practices
- Collaborate with Soil Survey of Pakistan to correlate scientific and local classification of soils and undertake or share detailed soil surveys
- Develop zoning plan for crops and fruits based on seasonal rainfall patterns, soil classification and availability of water
- Carry out land evaluation of Qila Saifullah District to compile current information and collect missing data
- Protect rights of tenant farmers to reduce incidence of bonded labour
- Improve women's access to information on modern agricultural practices
- Encourage adoption of productivity as crop yield per unit of water applied rather than unit area
- Experiment with farming cooperatives where small holdings less than 5 hectares are absorbed into bigger farms and managed collectively. This would have to be tried in areas where socio-economic dynamics would support application. Its results, experiences and impacts would be monitored, documented, disseminated and possibly replicated
- Develop agro-based SMEs, improve marketing infrastructure and boost access to agricultural credit
- Ensure access to information and participation in SMEs for women

### Long-term

- Shift to low delta agriculture, including fruit plants such as almond, pistachio and edible olive and vegetables
- Promote apple cultivation only in areas where climate supports the fruit's keeping requirements such as the mountainous areas of Muslim Bagh Tehsil
- Undertake detailed soil investigations in prime agricultural lands to estimate optimum yields of high value crops through best use of water and fertilizers
- Improve irrigation efficiency through land levelling, on-farm water management and technology-intensive irrigation methods such as bubbler/drip irrigation

## 4.6 Livestock and Rangelands

After agriculture, livestock rearing is the second most important economic activity in Qila Saifullah. In livestock farming areas, most households make a living out of raising small ruminants. More than two-thirds of the total geographic area is used as rangeland with transhumance livestock production being practised where livestock communities migrate seasonally with their flocks to rangelands where fodder is available. Some communities own land and are semi-sedentary while others do not and are semi-nomadic.

Two well defined routes are commonly used by pastoralists for year-round grazing. The north-south route is followed by the Pushtun from Ghilzai and Tareen in Afghanistan and the Kakars from Balochistan. Come autumn, they head towards the Loralai rangelands. In winter, their destination changes to the Harnai Rangelands in Sibi District. Animals move southwards from Muslim Bagh and Qila Saifullah through Shangloona. The east-west route is followed by the Brahvi who head towards the Sibi and Kacchi plains with their vast grazing grounds in winter.

This semi-nomadic lifestyle has been changing since the mid-1970s with the

introduction of irrigated agriculture and cash crops. An increasing number of livestock owners are settling near irrigated land and engaging in small-scale agriculture.

Small ruminants such as goats and sheep are the most common livestock in the district. After the drought of 1998 - 2004, goats became the most common animal, comprising three-quarters of the livestock population by 2006. Both goat and sheep are reared mainly in non-irrigated areas where rangelands provide pasture for meat, milk, financial security, particularly against unforeseen needs.

Draught animals such as horses, mules and donkeys form less than 4.5 percent of the population, with even fewer cattle and camels.

Animals suffer from a number of diseases and internal parasites despite the fact that veterinary coverage in Qila Saifullah is relatively better than other districts in the province.

Graziers are mostly men and children. Women are involved in feeding animals kept at home, treating sick livestock using traditional methods, cleaning out animal pens and preparing dung cakes.

Poultry farming is not practiced on a commercial scale in the district. A government poultry farm was established in Muslim Bagh in 1985 but its status is unknown and there are no farms in the private sector. Households do possess birds for family use that are looked after by the women. The Balochistan Rural Support Programme has provided training to women for poultry farming at the household level and introduced layer hens.

#### 4.6.1 Issues

Rangeland-based livestock systems are one of the major sources of livelihood for people living in harsh and arid regions. Balochistan has traditional rangeland property regimes where common rangelands are owned by tribes with customary arrangements for their management and open rangelands are on land owned by government with unrestricted access to herders. Both types have been severely degraded over the years due to lack of grazing management, removal of shrubs and trees for fuel and periodic droughts. Degradation has led to a decrease in rangeland productivity, changes in plant biodiversity with nutritious palatable species declining or disappearing, reduction in perennial plant cover and soil erosion. This



Mukhtiar Azad

Rearing small ruminants is among the key livelihood sources in Qila Saifullah

has also reduced carrying capacity of the rangelands in terms of the average livestock population that can be supported for a season without decreasing quality. This has far-reaching social and environmental implications.

The situation is exacerbated by lack of information and research. The area and distribution of rangelands is unknown as remote sensing imagery is not routinely used. Data on the carrying capacity of different rangelands is also not available just as there is inadequate research on grazing management, livestock-forage ratio (which is assumed to be adverse), high yield fodder species and supplemental feeds such as molasses/urea multi-nutrient blocks.

Though most people depend on small ruminants for their livelihoods, productivity has been falling over time. Livestock are generally underfed, suffer from diseases and internal parasites and arrive at markets at less than optimal weight. Large herds rather than quality animals are preferred and cross-breeding with imported livestock is gradually impacting on the native gene pool.

Nutrition is also a serious problem as the quantity and quality of forage in degraded rangelands is poor and supplemental feeding generally not practised. Livestock disease is another limiting factor with a number of easily communicable and infectious diseases prevalent in animals brought across the border by Afghan pastoralists. A lack of infrastructure, remote pastures and long migration routes makes the provision of veterinary services a challenge. There are few markets in the district and people have to depend on external markets in Kingri and Pishin.

Both transhumance and nomadic pastoralists face problems during their seasonal migrations. Forage availability is uncertain and facilities, both for graziers and their animals, along migratory routes are absent. As a result, herders have to depend on cooperation of local communities to get along. Also, pastoralists have continued with traditional practices even though degradation is visible as they have little access to improved knowledge on rangeland livestock management or alternative options.

Poultry, particularly household poultry, suffer from high mortality rates as veterinary hospitals or dispensaries are not equipped with appropriate vaccines or medicines. The threat of bird flu is high and vigilant control by the livestock department will need to be exercised.

Women neither have access to information on the livestock sector nor to improved livestock care or credit. Likewise, their participation in the poultry sector could be increased.

The district suffers periodically from drought. The long drought of 1998 - 2004 resulted in mortality of very large number of livestock, degradation of rangelands and irrecoverable losses to livestock-dependent communities. But reliable climatic data is not available and there are no drought early warning systems in place that could alert local people to changing conditions.

Administratively, livestock and rangelands have been separated. Livestock comes under the Livestock and Dairy Development Department while rangeland management has been shifted to the Forest and Wildlife Department. Coordination between the two departments is almost non-existent. This is particularly problematic as joint improvement and management is badly needed.

#### **4.6.2 Interventions**

Livestock and rangelands have lost their importance as a major source of income generation due to tube well irrigation of orchards and vegetable crops that provide high returns. As a result, the full potential of livestock and rangeland resources is not being tapped. But the livestock sector is important for poverty reduction in the district, as a majority of the very poor depend on it for their livelihoods. In fact, the livestock sector can become organized if more direction, veterinary services and credit is available.

Poultry farming is not practiced on a commercial scale. But that does not detract from its scope as poultry is a good source of protein, an income-generating activity for women and potential livelihood enterprise.

## Livestock

### Short-term

- Upgrade veterinary facilities
- Depute veterinary assistants to provide services such as vaccinations and treatment of common disease along established migratory routes
- Control infectious and communicable diseases introduced from across the border by livestock owned by Afghans
- Provide training to farmers to recognize and treat livestock disease
- Encourage use of supplemental feed during winter and early spring
- Support women to engage in poultry farming by providing inputs such as parent stock, vaccination, disease control kits and training to raise birds in homes
- Provide training in poultry disease detection and management to worker and farmers
- Develop local markets for poultry products, feed and medicines
- Revitalize poultry farms in public sector

### Medium-term

- Improve public sector extension services along migratory routes:
  - Construct lodging and boarding facilities for herders as well as livestock in remote range areas of known migratory routes
  - Develop water points and salt licks along established migratory routes
- Identify major constraints and technical possibilities to improve production: increase fodder in agricultural lands and feed production in industrial units to encourage animal fattening
- Introduce and promote value-added dairy farming

- Provide women with access to information and knowledge about livestock production, training in animal husbandry and credit to enhance participation in the sector
- Assist in setting up commercial poultry farms away from residential areas

### Long-term

- Maintain suitable ratio between livestock and forage
- Encourage graziers to focus on livestock quality rather than quantity and improving breed strains while conserving and propagating indigenous species
- Review existing livestock production systems and potential for higher value production with regard to markets, opportunities and prices
- Promote value addition of animal products, including skin, fleece and wool
- Facilitate livestock and livestock product marketing by setting one up for in the district
- Produce at least as much poultry products in the district as are needed to meet local demand

## Rangelands

### Short-term

- Provide rangeland management training to pastoralists
- Introduce high-yield grass varieties tested in other districts of the province such as Loralai

### Medium-term

- Survey and map rangelands using remote sensing technology and disseminate information among all stakeholders
- Zone rangelands according to ecological processes, soil quality and vegetation indicators



Rich harvest of grapes – under threat due to dwindling water resources

### Long-term

- Conduct research on fodder tree and shrub species to evaluate yield, nutritional value and suitability to local conditions in rangeland rehabilitation
- Monitor and evaluate carrying capacity and health of rangelands regularly along migratory routes for optimal management
- Enhance rangeland productivity by implementing management practices such as periodic closures, re-seeding and improved grazing management

## 4.7 Forests

Qila Saifullah supports coniferous and scrub forests. Coniferous forests occur at 1,500 to 3,500 metres, mainly in Torghar with chilghoza and kail as the dominant species. Scrub forests are found at 500 to 1,500 metres with wild olive, ash and willow being the key species. Besides forest areas, trees can be found along streams and *nullahs* in remote hilly areas of the district.

Legal protection has been provided to three areas: Khatoka, Tarawal and Nasai that have

been designated as State Forests under the Balochistan Forest Regulation, 1890.

There is no tradition for agro-forestry or raising trees for fuelwood or fodder, except in few areas where farmers plant trees along the banks of streams and nullahs to protect orchards or agricultural fields from flood water erosion. Agro-forestry integrates familiar and new agriculture and forestry practices into land management systems. There are several systems of agro-forestry being practiced in various agricultural areas of the world. Within each system, there is a variety of options available to landowners depending on their specific goals. For example, within a silvo-rangeland system the choices may include maximizing production of forage for livestock, with timber as a secondary product or targeting enhanced tree growth as the primary objective and co-manage for some enhanced forage and livestock values.

Agro-forestry has not attracted people in Qila Saifullah due to the availability of alternatives such as trees and bushes in state forests, rangelands and the wider countryside and the perception of competition with fruit trees, especially in irrigated areas.

The total area under forest cover in Qila Saifullah remains contentious. A map and inventory of forest vegetation in the wider countryside is not available.

Given that the majority of people are dependant on this natural resource for fuelwood for heating and cooking, timber for construction and non-timber forest products such as medicinal plants, the current stock is clearly inadequate for the requirements of the district. This does not include the environmental services provided by forests, including:

- carbon sequestration and mitigation of greenhouse gases
- water flow, availability and filtration for rural and urban water supply or hydro-electric uses
- watershed protection, including enhancement groundwater recharge, reduction of surface run-off and soil erosion and mitigating prospects of small-scale flooding
- biodiversity support by providing habitats for wildlife
- scenic landscape and spiritual and cultural amenities that present opportunities for income generation and enhanced quality of life

#### 4.7.1 Issues

The three state forests are not physically controlled or managed by the forest department, while Tarawal and Nasai are not even demarcated. Forests are under threat from cutting for fuelwood and timber, heavy livestock grazing and encroachments. Forest vegetation in the wider countryside is also being lost due to lack of land management and increase in mechanized transport. The result is that groundwater recharge has fallen, floral and faunal diversity is fast depleting and environmental services provided by forests are decreasing.

Lack of awareness of agro-forestry practices is affecting both the land and people. Natural resources have degraded to such an extent that they are unable to support the demand of

even the current population. As a result, people have to either pay a higher price for wood or walk longer distances to collect what they need.

Nurseries that can provide planting stock to the forest or other government departments, educational institutions and farmers are absent, limiting afforestation efforts.

Forest statistics in terms of area, demarcation, property rights and resource inventories are absent or uncertain, making resource management difficult.

Despite the demands of the general public, forestry is not a priority of the local and provincial governments and is not even budgeted for at the district level.

### 4.7.2 Interventions

#### Short-term

- Raise forest nurseries stocked with multi-purpose species that can be planted in state forests, around orchards, stream banks, roads, railway tracks as well as used for agro-forestry
- Promote agro-forestry, based on use of indigenous species by raising awareness through targeted campaigns, supplying planting stock and providing technical support
- Motivate communities to construct check dams to reduce surface run-off and provide moisture for small fuelwood plantations
- Reduce commercial harvesting of wood in forest lands, allowing only local communities to cut trees to meet their needs

#### Medium-term

- Promote multi-purpose tree plantations that can provide timber, energy and fodder and assist in soil and water conservation, carbon sequestration and biodiversity protection
- Promote apiculture and sericulture



Afghan urial is an important wildlife specie in the district

### Long-term

- Develop management plans for designated state forests with participation and input of local communities. Forest conservation would include biodiversity conservation, pasture management, sustainable harvesting of wild medicinal and aromatic plants and maintenance of environmental services
- Advocate plantations on communal lands, along stream and river banks, around storage and recharge dams and on borders of fields
- Motivate communities to participate in development, management and sustainable use of state forests and forest vegetation in the wider countryside

## 4.8 Biodiversity and Protected Areas

Qila Saifullah District is extremely important from the point of view of biodiversity. Wild mammals, including the Suleiman or straight-horned markhor, Afghan urial and cats can be

found in the area. The global 2006 IUCN *Red List of Threatened Species* categorizes the markhor as endangered and the urial as vulnerable. Hunting has wiped out the chinkara, after the last animal was gunned down in the Nasai plains of Zhob Valley.

There are plenty of resident and migratory birds, including birds of prey such as falcons and game such as chukor. Migratory waterfowl and birds, cranes in particular, use the Zhob River, the only significant wetland in the district, as a staging post during autumn and spring migrations between Afghanistan and India. While demoiselle and common cranes can still be found here, the Siberian and sarus cranes have not been sighted for quite some time. Fish are found in the karezes and some endemic fish fauna are thought to be present. But no information is available on fish species, their status or possible threats.

The district is home to the well-known Torghar Community Conservation Area in the Toba Kakar Range along the border with Afghanistan. In the mid-1900s, the mountains of northern Balochistan were rich in wildlife and held significant populations of Suleiman

markhor, Afghan urial, leopard and Asiatic black bear. Uncontrolled hunting, accelerated by the easy availability of cheap weapons due to the war in neighbouring Afghanistan, led to the leopard and the black bear being wiped out in the Torghar Hills by the mid-1980s, while the total combined population of Suleiman markhor and Afghan urial was estimated at about 200.

Originally conceived and developed in 1985, the Torghar Conservation Project was set up to stop illegal hunting and conserve the Suleiman markhor and Afghan urial. Along the way, social and economic welfare programmes were designed and developed for the people of the area, creating incentives for the involvement of local tribesmen and their families in conservation. The project has been so successful that an NGO called the Society for Torghar Environmental Protection was registered as a community-based, non-profit conservation organization in 1994. Since then, animal numbers have risen with the Suleiman markhor at 1,684 heads and the Afghan urial at 1,742 animals in 1999.

Other mammals found in the area include the wolf, hyena, fox, Pallas' cat, steppe wild cat and stone marten. About 78 bird species have been recorded, many of which breed in the area. The area also hosts many reptile species, including the horned and the leaf-nosed viper.

Community-managed conservation is a 'sector' with economic potential. The district government needs to prioritize biodiversity conservation and develop protected areas managed by local communities.

### 4.8.1 Issues

With the exception of animals and birds in the Torghar Community Conservation Area, wildlife and waterfowl species are on the decline in the district. This is generally because of population growth, increase in livestock numbers, improved access to remote areas, drought and indiscriminate hunting. Illegal trapping of cranes and falcons is also taking place mainly by trappers from southern districts of the NWFP. Though there is potential for declaring protected areas,

there are no state-owned protected areas in the district.

Similarly, the catchments of the Zhob River are not being managed. As a result, a bulk of the scanty precipitation drains out as surface run-off and many stretches of the river remain dry during different times of the year, reducing its potential as a wetland. The rangelands north of the river are important for wildlife which is being affected by pastoral activity through competition for forage, game hunting by herders and disturbances caused by people and livestock.

On the fish fauna front, exotic species of fish have been introduced in natural waters but the fish fauna of karezes have not been studied systematically.

### 4.8.2 Interventions

#### Short-term

- Control and manage hunting and trapping of wildlife, especially of cranes and falcon species
- Raise awareness about value of biodiversity and critical habitats to reduce land use changes, particularly the conversion of virgin land to agricultural land or to open access rangeland

#### Medium-term

- Support private land owners and communities in replicating the Torghar experience
- Inventory potential protected areas, including wetlands
- Declare state-owned biodiversity-rich areas as protected, with participation of local communities for ecotourism and sustainable consumptive use
- Develop management plans for key sites

#### Long-term

- Implement and monitor management plans of protected areas, including wetlands

# Diversifying the Economy

## 5.1 Minerals and Mining

**B**alochistan is part of a geological belt with known world-class mineral deposits. In Qila Saifullah, a number of metallic and non-metallic minerals are being mined in Muslim Bagh Tehsil with chromite and magnesite being the most important followed by gabbro, granite, limestone and sandstone.



Chromite mining is important to the district in terms of quantity, financial returns and employment potential. Muslim Bagh is known internationally for the quality of its chromite and produces more of this mineral than any other place in the province. Both high and low-grade chromite deposits are found here, with only the high-grade ore being mined. Production estimates vary tremendously and are unreliable. Though chromite mining started as far back as 1903, no processing units exist in the district. The size of the reserve at Nasai is believed to be small though local estimates suggest otherwise. Currently, geophysical investigations are being carried out by the Geological Survey of Pakistan (GSP) in the district.

After chromite, magnesite is the second most important mineral mined in the district. This is followed by dimension stone mining of gabbro, granite, limestone, sandstone and dunite where the natural stone is cut or shaped to a specific size to be used as building material with structural or decorative uses. The dimension stone market has been growing since the 1970s as the quality has improved because of machine cutting and polishing. Still, there is considerable future potential in this market.

The mines in operation in Muslim Bagh are not mechanized and are using manual labour for quarrying in both open-pit and underground mines.

### 5.1.1 Issues

GSP's assessment needs to be completed as soon as possible to confirm the extent and value of mineral deposits in the district. As long as the size of chromite deposits in Qila Saifullah remains unknown, substantial investment and development cannot take place. There is also incomplete documentation of production quantities.

Valuable chromite is neither processed nor used in the country and is exported to China. About 50 percent of the rock is inert, unusable material that only increases transportation costs. Beneficiating the ore would improve its chemical and physical properties and allow the metal to be recovered at a profit. A medium-sized

beneficiation plant for the district is being planned by the Small and Medium Enterprise Development Authority (SMEDA) but its location remains undecided.

As skilled labour for mining is not available locally, labour from other areas, particularly the NWFP, is hired. This has reduced job opportunities for locals. Also, the number of labourers seems to be under-reported to avoid paying social security benefits. Safety and occupational health guidelines are rarely followed and little safety equipment or training is available which compounds difficulties in case of accidents. Mining-related lung disease caused by exposure to minerals such as asbestos is also a problem.

The biggest issue with mining is the environmental damage that takes place. Land disturbance, remnant waste rock dumps, depletion and contamination of scarce groundwater, air pollution and disturbance of flora and fauna all adversely affect the environment. Abandoned mines also run the risk of collapsing. To date, EIAs of mining initiatives and reclamation of mined lands has not taken place in the district.

### 5.1.2 Interventions

#### Short-term

- Advocate for the early establishment of the SMEDA chromite beneficiation plant, preferably at Muslim Bagh due to its proximity to rich chromite mining areas and availability of water and power
- Ensure health safeguards are put in place in asbestos mines as the mineral has known long-term carcinogenic potential

#### Medium-term

- Enforce safety and occupational health guidelines in mines to protect workers through training for the mine management as well as workers and financial incentives to follow safety regulations
- Collect information on mining sector in Qila Saifullah, including prospecting and mining licenses, annual production and size of labour force

## Long-term

- Complete geophysical survey of district, especially of mineral-rich areas with modern equipment and techniques to get picture of size and value of different mineral reserves
- Assist chromite mining sector by undertaking detailed assessment of chromite reserves, exploring opportunity of mining and beneficiating low-grade chromite and possibility of setting up private sector chromite beneficiation units in district
- Explore adding value to mining of other minerals by promoting commercial-scale mining, expansion of dimension stone industry and processing at source
- Enforce EIAs to reduce environmental and social impact of mines, engage in regular environmental audits to ensure adherence to mitigation measures and follow rehabilitation guidelines when working mines are closed
- Support rehabilitation of abandoned quarry sites thorough pollution control, disposal of waste rock and landscaping

## 5.2 Small and Medium Enterprises

Besides some small furniture units in Muslim Bagh, there are no SMEs, let alone industry, in the district. This is not due to lack of potential. On the contrary, minerals, livestock, fruit and vegetables are some of the areas with possibilities of developing innovative SMEs that could provide new services, create jobs and foster social development.

## Interventions

### Short-term

- Study potential for the SME sector and the enterprises that can be set-up in the district:
  - Value-added agro-enterprises, covering:
    - fruit\* and vegetable grading,

packing, storage, processing and marketing

- sericulture\*
- dairy farming
- livestock and poultry feed, including molasses blocks
- compost\*
- enterprises specifically aimed at women: poultry farming; preserved, canned, cooked or baked food products using low quality fruits and vegetables
- Apiculture and honey production, processing, grading and marketing on a commercial scale
- Sustainable harvesting of wild plants and cultivation of local medicinal, aromatic and economically valuable plants
- Irrigation services such as land levelling, installation of drip or bubbler irrigation systems
- Refrigeration and cold storage facilities
- Machine repair:
  - agricultural machinery and tubewells
  - household equipment\*
- Provision of energy:
  - solar, wind and biogas
  - fuel-efficient cooking and heating stoves
- Low-cost insulation of houses
- Ecotourism
- Handicrafts\*:
  - knitted or sewn
  - wooden products

- basket making from mulberry twigs
- woollen carpets, rugs and other articles
- Interior decoration\*
- Computer and internet access
- Transport repair and maintenance services
- Export and import services, especially export of fruits, vegetables, livestock products and minerals

*Women can be involved in SMEs marked with an asterisk*

- Prioritize sub-sectors with high growth potential for private sector investment with current information on scale of financial investment, employment opportunities, level of skill or training required by labour and scope for public-private partnerships

### Medium-term

- Publicize potential and benefits of SMEs within the district and at provincial and federal level
- Create enabling environment for SMEs by providing technology, credit and training
- Establish market for fruits, vegetables, livestock and their value-added products in Qila Saifullah to attract buyers from region rather than transporting goods to markets outside the district to sell at lower prices

## 5.3 Tourism

Qila Saifullah has many cultural assets, including ancient forts, a narrow-gauge railway line, globally significant wildlife and plants, scenic landscapes and fruit orchards and mineral wealth.

### Archaeological Sites

Archaeological sites in the district date back to the Mughal period. These include:



Mukhtar Azad

Young pottery seller in the local market

- Mughalo Qila or Fort of the Mughals to the west of Karezgai village, about 3 kilometres from Muslim Bagh. Fragments of ancient pottery and silver and copper coins have been found in these ruins. Below the ruins, there is a spring that was reopened 125 years ago
- Khanki Fort near Shina Khura, about 25 kilometres east of Muslim Bagh
- Mughalo Brunj Fort in Murgha Faqirzai
- Forts at Toiwar, Sharan, Ismailzai as well as on the Zhar Hill near Akhtarzai
- Ancient karezes presumably built during the Mughal period

### **Kan Mehtarzai Valley**

Kan Mehtarzai is a picturesque valley with a variety of fruit orchards. The flower blossoms in spring and fruit-laden trees in late summer add to the beauty of the landscape. The town has the distinction of being the highest railway station on the Pakistan Railway network at 2,222 meters above sea level. The station was served by a narrow-gauge railway line that was closed in 1985 but is well known to railway buffs. Kan Mehtarzai Pass also marks the dividing line between the Central Asian and Continental watersheds.

### **Torghar Community Conservation Area**

Launched in 1985, the Torghar Conservation Project initially aimed to conserve the local population of the endangered Suleiman markhor and Afghan urial but in the process became a broader natural resource management programme. Besides the complete cessation of illegal hunting, around 700 square kilometres of conservation area is protected and managed by the people. A regulated trophy hunting programme is also underway. The experience of this community-managed conservation area is now well-known nationally and globally.

### **The Karez Cluster**

In Qila Saifullah, karezes are found only in

Muslim Bagh Tehsil, an unusually large number in a small area forming a unique cluster. Each karez has created particular societal relationships and socio-economic conditions in the villages they serve.

### **Chromite Charisma**

Chromite deposits in Muslim Bagh Tehsil are world class and in certain places, mixed with laurite, a platinum-bearing mineral. Visits to the chromite mines offer access to a completely different world.

### **Pakistan-Afghanistan Border**

The border at Badini is located in a very remote rural area. Against the background of the Durand Line, properly organized visits to the border can be potentially attractive for domestic tourists.

### **Takht-e-Sulaiman**

The highest point of the Sulaiman Mountain Range is Takht-e-Sulaiman or Solomon's Throne. Located at the northern end of the range in neighbouring Zhob District, Takht-e-Sulaiman offers excellent trekking and mountaineering opportunities on all sides. Chilghoza and blue pine forests and interesting wildlife can be found in the surrounding hills.

### **5.3.1 Issues**

Qila Saifullah does not have a tourism industry. The potential remains untapped due to inadequate infrastructure and facilities, poor promotion of cultural assets, little written or visual material on the sites themselves and a negative image about the area in the press.

Moreover, foreigners need a special permit from the provincial home department to visit places outside Quetta. As long as this condition is applicable, there is no possibility of promoting international tourism.

### **5.3.2 Interventions**

The district has sites that can attract tourists, providing the impetus for a new industry that can enhance economic activity in the area.

### Short-term

- Encourage domestic tourism in the district. In the short term, the Irrigation Rest House at Muslim Bagh can be renovated or reconstructed and used as a tourist lodging facility
- Negotiate with provincial home department to allow foreign tourists to visit Qila Saifullah without special permission

### Medium-term

- Engage in heritage conservation in collaboration with the provincial Culture, Archives and Tourism Department by protecting archaeological sites, including prehistoric caves and carvings, through the Antiquity Act 1975 and taking steps to reduce their deterioration. Promote these sites through advertising and publicity packages and other related tourist services
- Encourage and prioritize community-based tourism that involves local people and is beneficial to them
- Explore possibility of opening mines to students and tourists
- Persuade locals to train as tourist guides and link them with national and international travel companies

### Long-term

- Promote tourism in Qila Saifullah in collaboration with provincial and federal agencies such as the Pakistan Tourism Development Cooperation. The district could be one of the points on tourist trails in Balochistan covering archaeological and historical sites, railways, karezes, flora and fauna and scenic landscapes.
- Conserve scenic landscapes and promote their use for tourism
- Engage in public-private sector partnerships to develop tourism infrastructure, including transport, accommodation and restaurants,

information centres, recreational sites and handicrafts/souvenir shops

- Explore possibility of introducing adventure tourism in the district such as trekking and winter sports. Arrange rescue facilities, in collaboration with army, if adventure tourism and trekking is to be promoted in Kakar Khurasan.

## 5.4 Infrastructure: Roads and Energy

### Roads

Though Qila Saifullah is a rural district, it is connected with other parts of the province and the country by road. Except for Zhob Valley, the remainder of the district is mountainous with a rugged terrain.

Both Qila Saifullah and Muslim Bagh towns are served by the Quetta-Zhob-Dera Ismail Khan National Highway or N-50 while the Qila Saifullah-Loralai-Dera Ghazi Khan Highway or N-70 intersects with N-50 at Qila Saifullah Town. This connects the district with other parts of Balochistan, the Punjab and NWFP, making it part of a larger metalled road network constructed and maintained by the federal National Highway Authority. But insufficient attention has been paid to repair and maintenance with the result that the quality of the national highways is poor and their capacity to handle traffic remains restricted because of their narrow width and long transport time.

Both the N-50 and N-70 are to be upgraded under a project to improve the provincial road network and the priority transport corridor linking Pakistan, Afghanistan and Central Asia that passes through Balochistan. Qila Saifullah's strategic location does mean that the district could become a hub for the transport system that links the Punjab and NWFP with Balochistan.

Other than the national highways, the remainder of the road network is shingle or dirt. The provincial Communications and Works Department constructs and maintains all the shingle roads and a small portion of the



Improving the communication network – road construction in progress

metalled road in the district. The total length of roads, metalled and shingle, is 405.5 kilometres. Intra-district access is poor and hampers marketing and travel.

Qila Saifullah district had a narrow-gauge railway line that is presently closed. But there are plans to develop a broad-gauge railway line connecting Gwadar with China, with the Quetta-Dera Ismail Khan section passing through the district.

### 5.4.1 Issues

Highly inequitable cost-benefits and few financial resources are two of the main reasons behind the poor road network in Kakar Khurasan. The high maintenance cost of vehicles running on shingle roads or fair-weather tracks makes transport costly for people in the area. If socio-economic conditions in Kakar Khurasan are to improve, road construction and maintenance should be given priority.

### 5.4.2 Interventions

The development of communication infrastructure is key to opening of remote

areas, provision of social services and basic facilities, marketing of agricultural produce and minerals, general economic development, including SMEs, and integration of isolated communities.

#### Short-term

- Maximize benefits of planned infrastructure projects such as improvements of national highways by participating actively in their design, planning and implementation. Affected communities should also be involved at each stage
- Ensure EIAs for all road construction or improvement projects in the district are carried out in letter and spirit

#### Medium-term

- Take environmental and social mitigation measures recommended in EIAs
- Implement town planning guidelines and controls to reduce ribbon development along highways and railway lines

## Long-term

- Develop and manage settlements and roadside facilities to avoid unplanned growth

## Energy

There is little commercial consumption of energy as households meet their requirement through biomass, kerosene, liquid petroleum gas (LPG) and electricity.

Electricity is provided to 40.3 percent of households, primarily in Zhob Valley, and is used mainly for lighting and tubewells. Long periods of load shedding are common with farmers using electric tubewells being the most affected. Piped natural gas has not been supplied to the district and LPG is used in limited amounts for cooking. Kerosene is the other fuel available though it is expensive and used for lighting only. Most of Qila Saifullah's energy needs are met through biomass, primarily fuelwood, used for cooking and heating

Recognizing the urgent need for alternative energy sources, the federal government is undertaking a National Rural Electrification Programme (NREP) through Alternative/Renewable Energy Technologies under which 335 villages in Balochistan, including 40 villages in Qila Saifullah, will be electrified using solar photovoltaic panels. Electricity will be provided to each household for lighting and television, village to run submersible pumps to improve drinking water supply and for SMEs. But social service infrastructure such as school buildings and health units will not be electrified under the NREP.

### 5.4.3 Issues

Qila Saifullah's requirements are not being adequately met due to a severe shortage of energy in the district. This has prevented the development of SMEs that are dependant on an adequate and dependable supply of electricity or gas. Equally, the provision of energy services to remote rural areas is needed to increase their standard of living, health and education.

Electricity coverage of the district is inadequate with households mainly in Zhob Valley receiving this service. The remaining 60 percent of the population is without electricity. There are a host of reasons behind inadequate coverage, including insufficient generation, high transmission and distribution losses, small scattered settlements and problems supplying electricity through transmission lines in mountainous terrains.

Similarly, natural gas is not being supplied to the district even though the largest gas field in the country is in Sui, Balochistan. LPG use is also limited due to high cost and erratic supply of LPG cylinders.

The resultant energy demand and supply gap is met through heavy dependence on fuelwood and dung cakes. Wood cutting is placing pressure on rangeland vegetation and forests with decreasing plant cover leading to soil erosion, reduced groundwater recharge and biodiversity loss. The use of dung as fuel instead of manure has affected agriculture, resulting in poor soil quality and decreased capacity for absorbing and storing water.

Women are disproportionately affected by this lack of energy as they are the primary providers and users of energy. The time and physical effort expended by women and girls in gathering fuel seriously limits their ability to engage in educational and income-generating activities. Women are also exposed to a variety of health hazards from cooking over poorly ventilated indoor fires and suffer from a number of respiratory diseases. Women's needs have to be taken into account in the design and implementation of energy projects.

Renewable energy has been tried in Balochistan but it needs to be adopted on a large scale to meet the energy gap. Solar, wind and biogas energy all need to be explored for potential use in Qila Saifullah.

Most of all, adequate, reliable data on energy supply and demand in the district needs to be generated.

### 5.4.4 Interventions

Energy is central to sustainable development and poverty reduction efforts. Major efforts are



Grid station at Qila Saifullah

needed to improve the quantity and quality of energy in Qila Saifullah. An adequate, reliable and affordable supply would have a positive impact on the quality of life in the district, by generating employment opportunities, improving transportation, health, education and water supply and sanitation and reducing environmental degradation. The availability of energy would also make significant difference in the lives of women, reducing their drudgery and increasing their access to non-polluting power for lighting, cooking and other household and productive purposes. This can have dramatic effects on women's levels of empowerment, education, literacy, nutrition, health, economic opportunities and involvement in community activities. These improvements in women's lives can, in turn, have significant beneficial consequences for their families and communities.

### Short-term

- Promote efficient use of energy in transport, agricultural and domestic sectors
- Ensure wider availability of LPG through provision of subsidies and a regulated

distribution and marketing system that is monitored frequently. This would ensure an adequate supply of cylinders, especially in urban areas

- Introduce metering of electricity used for agricultural tubewells and adopt slab system with tariffs based on units consumed with a reasonable subsidy. Alternately, subsidize introduction of high-efficiency irrigation systems
- Extend electricity coverage from national grid and reduce load shedding
- Develop comprehensive energy sector plan for Qila Saifullah. Given the rural nature of the district, the strategy should deliberately address rural energy needs, particularly for small-scale, informal, domestic and agricultural production activities. The plan should also address energy concerns of women.

### Medium-term

- Support use of alternative sources of energy such as coal and coal cakes as well as fuel-efficient stoves. Low-cost coal

cakes could be made from poor quality coal or wastage from coal mines in the province. This would also assist in reducing deforestation and vegetation loss

- Assess impact of alternative energy sources such as solar photovoltaics introduced by the NREP
- Explore potential of natural gas supply to villages along N-50
- Encourage gas and oil exploration in district

### **Long-term**

- Raise multi-purpose tree plantations, including trees grown for fuelwood

- Encourage use of Compressed Natural Gas in vehicles, particularly after improvement of N-50 and N-70
- Increase off-grid coverage of electricity in the district, particularly for small settlements that are more than 20 kilometres away from national grid and where electrification is not planned within the next decade through the installation of decentralized small-scale energy systems powered by renewable technologies using solar photovoltaics, micro-hydro, wind and biogas for small villages and solar thermal systems for larger settlements

# Information and Communications

**D**ecision making needs to be based on current information and knowledge. Today, that knowledge is available through a variety of sources such as media, internet, past experiences, specialists and stakeholders. Solutions may be complex and require an integrated rather than sectoral approach. Government departments, NGOs and field projects are the more obvious decision-makers but people too are making local-level decisions about their lives. Consequently, they also need access to timely information and knowledge to improve the quality of their lives.



Sparse information is available on Qila Saifullah district, key sources for which are the District Profile 1997, District Census Report 1998 and information provided by the EDOs. Further information is available through provincial-level documentation such as District-Based Multiple Indicators Cluster Survey 2004 or national-level research studies conducted by institutions such as the Social Policy Development Centre and the National Institute of Population Studies. Data and information held by CSOs and CBOs is unknown. In sum, the information that does exist continues to be scattered and Qila Saifullah does not have any GIS or management information system to process its own data.

Today, GIS offers a set of tools that has brought efficiency to decision making, allowed transparency and opened development to public accountability. All over the world, the contribution of this technology at the municipal level has shown amazing results in handling diverse data at various scales and levels of generalization. Even in Pakistan, the initial results of pilots that have used GIS have produced positive results.

For its part, TMA, Jaranwala District, has taken a number of innovative steps to improve service delivery. With private sector and NGO involvement, the tehsil is constructing a comprehensive database of existing infrastructure, including the number of water outlets, pipes, drains, and other details of sewerage, gas and telephone connections. This database has been integrated into a GIS system and used to prepare a master plan for the town. In Balochistan, the Area Development Programme runs a GIS inherited from foreign-funded projects on natural resources.

Management support systems such as databases and management information systems have also been established at the provincial level. BEMIS and BHMIS collect district-level data on education and health.

The efficiency of the district administration could be enhanced manifold by using GIS as the district map could be digitized and thematic data linked to it, improving efficiency and quality of decision making as well as the

performance of local government. Hardware and software have also become more affordable, presenting less of a financial problem. They could also be integrated with management information systems such BEMIS and BHMIS.

Public accountability is only possible if information and knowledge is easily available either as printed material or on the internet. Recently, there have been some efforts to communicate with the public and seek their involvement in data collection or project design and implementation. The Participatory Poverty Assessment was carried out in Batozai Union Council and involved extensive dialogues with the community and separate discussions with women. Similarly, the Qila Saifullah IDV consultation phase involved meetings with stakeholders.

Communication channels include radio, television and newspapers, the last being more popular in urban areas than rural settlements. Radio Pakistan Quetta is received throughout the district because of a high power radio transmitter at Yaru near Pishin. Pakistan Television's reception is limited as the district is out of transmission range but a low range television booster at Muslim Bagh does transmit the signal, albeit weakly. As a result, most people watch satellite television.

## 6.1 Issues

Qila Saifullah lacks basic information for development decision making. This includes a map of the district covering the tehsils and sub-tehsils currently under its jurisdiction, an accurate assessment of its geographical area and basic data on a number of sectors.

Systematic collection of data and compilation of statistics in most sectors in the district is lacking. This mirrors the situation at the provincial level where the ability of different departments to compile reliable information varies widely and the credibility of statistical information is poor. The only exceptions may be the education and health sectors that have management information systems supported by the federal government and donor agencies. At the district level, the collection of reliable data and its optimal use needs to be emphasized.

Information documented during scientific research, project development, implementation and monitoring and evaluation is available with the agencies, line departments, district administrations, project teams, academics, consultants and others. Though CSOs also have valuable information on their sectors, little of this information is available or integrated with public sector knowledge. Evaluations or lessons learned are rarely circulated and shared due to which the opportunity of replication of successful programmes and projects is lost.

In some cases, information is also withheld from the public on account of national security issues. The rules on classified documents need to be updated so that information needed for policy planning and management can be shared. One example is the Soil Reconnaissance Survey Report of Zhob District which covers the current Qila Saifullah district. The report was withheld by the Soil Survey of Pakistan and the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock on account of its classified status.

More efforts need to be made to raise awareness or elicit public opinion in district programme and project design and implementation. While literacy levels are a stumbling block, innovative use of traditional media such as radio and newspapers could be made. Communication channels could include:

- local announcements by travelling newscasters to the beat of drums
- programmes on radio and television
- community radio
- social and cultural events and community gatherings
- district government bulletins distributed with newspapers and pasted at specific points in public sector institutions such as schools, colleges, healthcare facilities, bus stands, courts, post offices and markets
- an official district website for local government in Qila Saifullah

That said, for the information to be credible it has to be apolitical and freely disseminated. Standard visual designs would assist in recognition of the source and quality of the information.

## 6.2 Interventions

### Short-term

- Collect baseline data on the district, covering geographical area, population, social sectors and data needed to update MICS and monitor implementation of the BPRSP, economic data, particularly on mining and minerals and SMEs and a natural resource inventory
- Train district government staff in data collection and collation, focusing on importance of quality and need for verification
- Raise awareness through communication campaigns on:
  - CCBs
  - need for active involvement in Census 2008
  - importance of protecting drinking water sources, health-related consequences of unsafe drinking water and possible solutions
  - climate and drought broadcasts
  - impact of falling groundwater tables
  - environmental issues
  - participation in design and implementation of large projects
  - employment opportunities
  - SMEs
  - new products and innovations in different sectors
  - value of cultural heritage

- moving towards progressive development practices rather than adhering to time-bound traditions and customs.
- Extend radio coverage to remote areas to enable community service programmes in Pushto and Urdu to be broadcast to households, farmers, graziers and women
- Encourage community radio services that could deliver well-targeted information to people
- Explore possibility of infusing teacher and LHVs training programmes with modules on current trends and practices in these sectors and on information sources in the district. Alternatively, consider using LHV network to pass information to women
- Support *ulema* to raise awareness of successful development initiatives in other districts
- Develop and distribute regular information material and bulletins on successful development initiatives in other districts
- Translate *QSSoED* and *QSIDV* into Urdu and distribute copies to key stakeholders and implementing agencies, including all educational institutions, public offices, NGOs, provincial departments, relevant federal ministries, agencies and bi- and multilateral institutions.
- Survey information needs of various groups of stakeholders and disseminate material based on need and preferred channels of communication
- Establish information centres at the district, tehsil and union levels to make available a variety of information on government and projects and sustainable natural resource management
- Strengthen BEMIS and BHMIS at the district level and install GIS-based management information systems in other departments in the district
- Liaise with provincial government to encourage collection of accurate district-level data
- Promote use of newspapers as means of communication for the literate and encouraging use of pictorial material for non-literate audience
- Introduce, promote or expand e-mail service in areas where electricity and telephone facilities are available to assist quick exchange of local-level information and exposure to material available on internet

### Medium-term

- Convince departments, research institutions, CSOs and bi- and multilateral agencies to share information, particularly printed documents

### Long-term

- Implement local area network between departments to share information electronically, monitor physical implementation of projects and information dissemination
- Extend television transmission coverage and supply television sets to communities at subsidized rates or gratis to overcome problems of communication. Separate sets would have to be provided for men and women to ensure that the entire community benefits from the medium

# Future Programmes and Projects

**Q**ila Saifullah is covered by federal and provincial level programmes and projects with more planned for the future. Development opportunities would be created by these initiatives but many challenges will also have to be faced at the same time to optimize the social, economic and environmental benefits that could accrue from these schemes.



To take advantage of these large-scale projects, the district government will not only have to be an active participant in the design, implementation and monitoring process but also advocate for pro-poor and gender options, ensure EIA recommendations and their mitigation measures are followed and public-private partnership opportunities promoted. The programmes will also provide scope for local-level participation, particularly by communities that may be affected or involved in these developments.

The current and planned federal and provincial government initiatives include targeted poverty reduction programmes such as Khushal Pakistan that is slated to focus on improving infrastructure, providing electricity, gas and clean drinking water to people, along with health and education services in rural and low-income areas. Then there is the Rozgar Scheme that is mandated to provide microcredit facilities for the young and unemployed and serve as a conduit for the President's special grants. In addition, major communication infrastructure projects are being undertaken that will cover national highways and railway.

Foreign-funded projects include the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)/ Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO) Area Development Programme and the Food Security/Poverty Alleviation in Arid Agriculture: Balochistan Pilot Project Phase technically supported by FAO.

The GoB is also investing in the Patab Water Development Scheme which is similar to the Nasai Water Development Scheme.

It is particularly important to keep in mind that new and up-coming programmes and projects should provide opportunities to:

- improve governance by strengthening devolution and legislation
- integrate society by focusing on a common development agenda
- accommodate poverty reduction, gender equity and environmental imperatives
- strengthen institutions and competencies to manage complex issues and devise solutions
- improve supply of clean drinking water and sanitation, education and healthcare services
- increase irrigation efficiency through use of technology such as land levelling, on-farm water management, bubbler, sprinkler and spray irrigation
- diversify agriculture to include cultivation of high-yield, low delta fruit, vegetable and other crops
- launch SMEs based on dairy products, poultry farming, apiculture, sericulture, fruit and vegetable processing, wool-based enterprises, handicraft production, mineral processing and trade and commerce.
- improve mining and minerals sector through better management of mines, increased health and safety procedures and processing at source
- upgrade communication infrastructure through expansion of district road network and rail links
- conserve cultural and natural areas and promote their use for tourism
- increase multi-purpose tree plantations for timber, fuel, fodder, water and soil conservation, biodiversity regeneration and carbon sequestration
- replicate experience of Torghar Community Conservation Area
- establish wildlife protected areas for ecotourism and sustainable consumptive use

# Implementing the Vision

**T**he *QSIDV* has been developed with the consensus and participation of its people. As such, it is their vision for the future. Similarly, responsibility for implementation lies not only with the local government as in the district, tehsil and union administrations but also with the wider group of stakeholders, including:

- CSOs
- private sector (mining, agriculture, transport, business and tourism)
- media (print, electronic and the internet)



- academia (education and research organizations)
- communities
- provincial government
- Water and Power Development Authority
- National Highway Authority
- Pakistan Railways
- federal government

The less obvious stakeholders who may have a stake in the development taking place also need to take responsibility and participate in IDV implementation. These include transporters passing through the district, fruit and vegetable-related SME investors and traders from the Pishin or Rakhni livestock markets.

The district would strive for complete devolution of power, fiscal decentralization and revenue generation. To this end, the IDV will seek to build and use its capacity to identify, develop, resource and implement programmes and projects that would put the IDV into practice. Similarly, it would focus on human resource development and make use of various federal and provincial programmes and projects being implemented in the district besides launching its own initiatives.

Foreign-assisted projects or development aid funds can also be expected to support the programmes, projects and priorities of the IDV since they constitute a home-grown agenda developed through a wide consultative process.

## 8.1 Institutional Arrangements

IDV Steering Committee will be established to oversee and guide implementation. Consisting of 12 to 15 members, the committee will be headed by the zila nazim and include representatives from public sector organizations as well as the private sector, including the Kissan Committee, CSOs, academia and media, politicians, religious

leaders and tribal chiefs and elders. The EDO, Finance and Planning will be the secretary of the committee and be responsible for calling meetings and ensuring implementation of decisions. The committee would meet on a quarterly basis in the first year and six monthly from then onwards.

A Management Committee headed by the EDO, Finance and Planning and comprising key implementing agencies, including CSOs, will be established to ensure coordination, sort out implementation problems and oversee monitoring and evaluation. The committee's membership may be limited to 10 but it may co-opt as many members as needed at any particular time. The recommendations of this committee regarding progress and unresolved issues would be reported to the steering committee.

These committees would develop their own Terms of Reference and Rules and Procedures of Business.

The Sustainable Development Forum established during the development phase of the IDV will continue as an open-ended forum as it would permit participation of a larger group of stakeholders in development planning. This forum, under the chairmanship of the Zila Council speaker would meet at least once in six months to come up with points for consideration of the IDV Steering Committee.

The good offices of the Balochistan Local Government Commission would be used to enhance understanding and resolve issues among local governments in the district and province and between the local government and the provincial and federal governments.

The district would seek the assistance of credible and interested national and international organizations or agencies in the implementation of the IDV, including the promotion of best practises of governance and replicable sustainable development processes.

## 8.2 Financial Resources

Fiscal autonomy is a critical aspect of devolution. Fiscal decentralization in general



Capacity building of stakeholders was one of the key steps during development of IDV

means the empowerment of governments at various levels to levy taxes, set tax rates and generate a substantial portion of their revenues independently. In Pakistan, the term refers to the complete financial system, including the distribution of resources, transfer of funds, taxation, budgeting, accounting and auditing.

Chapters XII and XII-A of the BLGO 2001 present a landmark change in fiscal decentralization and financial management. Fiscal decentralization is channelized through the Provincial Finance Commission, a statutory body set up under section 120-A of BLGO 2001. The commission expresses its vision in the form of an award the main objective of which is to provide a transparent, formula-based and predictable inter-governmental revenue sharing system to enable local governments to improve service delivery in the district. The formula needs to be acceptable to the districts and can be based on population, area, development status, revenue generation capacity and cost of recurring expenditure. For a number of reasons, including a lack of data, the current formula is based on population and area.

So far, four awards have been announced, one for each year. The awards were in fact simulations of four different fiscal transfer systems. The information generated by those simulations has now enabled the commission to announce an award for a longer period: the 5th Award is for the financial years, July 1, 2006 to June 30, 2009. But this is only a step towards fiscal decentralization as there are still differences in positions on whether the award should be area or population based, delays in the finalization of award requirements and benefits of the system have still to become visible.

To date, complete fiscal decentralization to the districts has not taken place. Nor have the districts been able to generate substantial revenues. Even if small revenues relating to health and education services are collected by the district government, they continue to be deposited in the provincial revenue account. As a result, district governments continue to depend on provincial and federal governments for funds for recurring as well as development expenditure. This situation has caused problems in undertaking any regular activities by some of the district government

departments. The departments related to natural resources such as forests, agriculture and livestock have suffered the most. It is important to make best use of the president's annual grants and the federal government-supported human resource development programmes to build capacity in the district.

Financial resources and their efficacy could be enhanced by adopting a number of approaches:

- Implementing all projects in the district through the district government, irrespective of source of funds, be they federal, provincial or allocations to public representatives
- Efficient allocation of funds, with a focus on project impact and stringent controls on public spending
- Raising local revenue through taxes, levies, rents and user charges that are retained with the district government
- Balancing the budget between staff salaries and activities
- Dealing firmly with misappropriation of funds

- Requesting grants from provincial and federal governments
- Tapping development aid in the form of grants and soft loans, directly or through channels such as the government or CSOs
- Advocating new criteria for equitable sharing of funds among local governments with the provincial government
- Advocating complete fiscal decentralization

### **8.3 Monitoring and Evaluation**

Implementation milestones for all recommendations would be worked out in collaboration with implementing agencies with administrative and financial assistance being provided, if required. Internal monitoring at six-monthly intervals and external monitoring annually will be carried out. The lessons learned will be identified, documented and disseminated for replication or scaling up. Whereas monitoring would focus on IDV implementation, evaluation would concentrate on impacts that have occurred as a result of implementation.

- Ahmad, Shahid, Zahid Hussain, Asaf Sarwar Qureshi, Rashida Majeed and Mohammad Saleem, 2004. *Drought Mitigation in Pakistan: Current Status and Options for Future Strategies*. Working Paper 85. Colombo, Sri Lanka: International Water Management Institute.  
<http://www.iwmi.cgiar.org/pubs/working/WOR85.pdf>.
- Ali, Syed Mohammed, 2004. *Identification of Best Practices under Devolution in Pakistan*. Islamabad: CIDA Devolution Support Project.  
<http://www.policy.hu/ali/Identification%20of%20best%20practices%20in%20devolution.pdf>.
- Arid Zone Research Centre, Quetta.  
<http://www.parc.gov.pk/azrc/azrc.html>
- Asian Development Bank, October 2003. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on a Proposed Loan and Technical Assistance Loan and Technical Assistance Grant to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Balochistan Road Development Sector Project*. Manila: ADB.  
[http://www.adb.org/Documents/RRPs/PAK/rrp\\_pak\\_34333.pdf](http://www.adb.org/Documents/RRPs/PAK/rrp_pak_34333.pdf)
- Asian Development Bank, November 2004. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on Proposed Loans and Technical Assistance Grants to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Balochistan Resource Management Program*. Manila: ADB.  
<http://www.adb.org/Documents/RRPs/PAK/rrp-pak-37135.pdf>
- Asian Development Bank, November 2005. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on Proposed Program Loans, Technical Assistance Loan, and Asian Development Fund Grant to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan: Balochistan Devolved Social Services Program*. Manila: ADB.  
<http://www.adb.org/Documents/RRPs/PAK/37218-PAK-RRP.pdf>
- Asian Development Bank/UK Department for International Development/World Bank, 2004. *Devolution in Pakistan: Overview of the ADB/DfID/World Bank Study*. Islamabad: ADB/DfID/WB. <http://go.worldbank.org/T255016GD0>

- Decentralisation Support Program, n.d. *Citizen Community Board Policy Dialogue - Outcome Report*. <http://www.decentralization.org.pk/docs/CB.pdf>
- District Government Faisalabad, TMA Jaranwala. [http://www.faisalabad.gov.pk/departments/tma\\_jaranwala.php](http://www.faisalabad.gov.pk/departments/tma_jaranwala.php)
- EDO Education, Qila Saifullah District, paper presented to author, 2006.
- EDO Livestock, Qila Saifullah District, paper presented to author, 2006.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation/World Food Programme, 2001. *FAO/WFP Crop and Food Supply Assessment Mission to Pakistan, 11 July 2001*. Islamabad: FAO/WFP. <http://www.fao.org/docrep/004/y1260e/y1260e00.htm>
- Global Water Partnership, GWP Catalyzing Change Series, Policy Brief No 4, How IWRM will contribute to achieving the MDGs. [http://www.gwpforum.org/gwp/library/Policy\\_brief\\_4\\_MDGs.pdf](http://www.gwpforum.org/gwp/library/Policy_brief_4_MDGs.pdf)
- Global Water Partnership. <http://www.gwpforum.org/servlet/PSP>
- Government of Balochistan, 1997. *Killa Saifullah-A District Profile*. Quetta: Planning and Development Department, GoB.
- Government of Balochistan, 2001. *Balochistan Local Government Ordinance 2001*. Quetta: GoB. [www.nrb.gov.pk/publications/Balochistan\\_Local\\_Government\\_Ordinance\\_2001.pdf](http://www.nrb.gov.pk/publications/Balochistan_Local_Government_Ordinance_2001.pdf)
- Government of Balochistan, 2003. *Balochistan Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Quetta: GoB.
- Government of Balochistan, 2003. *Between Hope and Despair: Pakistan Participatory Poverty Assessment: Balochistan Report*. Quetta: Planning and Development Department, GoB.
- <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/pubs/files/ppa-balochistan.pdf>
- Government of Balochistan, 2005. *Development Statistics of Balochistan 2003-04*. Quetta: Bureau of Statistics, GoB.
- Government of Balochistan, n.d. *Agricultural Statistics of Balochistan, 2002-03*. Quetta: Statistical Wing, Directorate General of Agriculture (Extension), GoB.
- Government of Balochistan, n.d. Provincial Finance Commission, Balochistan, 5th Award, July, 2006 to 30th June, 2009. <http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/New%20Folder/PFC%20Report.pdf>
- Government of Balochistan and IUCN Pakistan, 2000. *Balochistan Conservation Strategy*. Karachi: GoB and IUCN.
- Government of Balochistan, Planning and Development Department in collaboration with Federal Bureau of Statistics and UNICEF, 2004. *District-Based Multiple Indicators Cluster Survey 2004*. Quetta: GoB. <http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/New%20Folder/Balochistan%20Report.pdf>
- Institute of Governance Canada, What is Governance? <http://www.iog.ca/page.asp?pageID=3&htmlarea=home>
- International Water Management Institute. Beyond More Crop Per Drop. <http://www.iwmi.cgiar.org/WWF4/html/index.htm>
- IUCN 2006. *2006 IUCN Red List of Threatened Species*. <[www.iucnredlist.org](http://www.iucnredlist.org)>. Downloaded on 30 April 2007.
- Johnson, Isabelle, 1997. *Redefining the Concept of Governance*. Ottawa: Canadian International Development Agency. [http://www.acdi/cida.gc.ca/INET/IMAGES.NSF/vLUIImages/HRDG/\\$file/GovConcept-e.pdf#search=22definition20concepts20governance22](http://www.acdi/cida.gc.ca/INET/IMAGES.NSF/vLUIImages/HRDG/$file/GovConcept-e.pdf#search=22definition20concepts20governance22)

- LEAD Pakistan, n.d. *District Education Plan-Killa Saifullah*, First Draft. Report prepared for USAID Education Sector Reform Assistance.  
[http://www.lead.org.pk/proj\\_edul3.htm](http://www.lead.org.pk/proj_edul3.htm)
- Mirza, Mohammad Ali, 2007. Gender and Energy Considerations in Sustainable Development Efforts in Pakistan. In *Where Energy is Women's Business: National and Regional Reports from Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Pacific*, ed. Gail Karlsson. Netherlands: ENERGIA, International Network on Gender and Sustainable Energy.  
[http://www.energia.org/resources/csdpub/natrep\\_pakistan.pdf](http://www.energia.org/resources/csdpub/natrep_pakistan.pdf)
- National Commission for Human Development, verbal communication with IUCN Balochistan Office, June 7, 2007.
- National Reconstruction Bureau, 2006. *Local Government System in Pakistan and the Aberdeen Agenda: Symposium on Strengthening Decentralization in Pakistan and the Commonwealth. Organized by the National Reconstruction Bureau in collaboration with Commonwealth Local Government Forum & Commonwealth Secretariat, July, 2006.* Islamabad: NRB.  
<http://www.nrb.gov.pk/ssdp/default.asp>
- National Reconstruction Bureau, *Best Practices in Local Government System.*  
[http://www.mng.gov.pk/mng/media\\_resources/best\\_practices.asp](http://www.mng.gov.pk/mng/media_resources/best_practices.asp)
- National Reconstruction Bureau in collaboration with Government of Balochistan, 2006. *International Conference on Fiscal Decentralization, 3-4 May 2006, Islamabad. Fiscal Decentralization Balochistan.* Islamabad: NRB.  
<http://www.mng.gov.pk/icfd/balochistan/default.asp>
- Population Census Organization, 2000. *District Census Report of Killa Saifullah 1998.* Islamabad: PCO, Statistics Division, GoP.
- Social Policy and Development Center. 2001. *Social Development in Pakistan: Growth, Inequality and Poverty.* Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- UK Department for International Development. Sustainable Livelihoods Guidance Sheets.  
[http://www.livelihoods.org/info/info\\_guidancesheets.html#6](http://www.livelihoods.org/info/info_guidancesheets.html#6)
- UNDP in collaboration with ENERGIA, 2004. *Energy and Gender for Sustainable Development: A Toolkit and Resource Guide.*  
<http://www.undp.org/energy/gendereng.htm>
- UNESCAP, Human Settlements, Local Government in Asia and the Pacific, Country Reports on Local Government Systems: Pakistan.  
<http://www.unescap.org/huset/lgstudy/new-countrypaper/Pakistan/Pakistan.pdf>
- UN/International Strategy for Disaster Reduction, 2005. *A Review of Disaster Management Policies and Systems in Pakistan for World Conference on Disaster Reduction 2005.*  
<http://www.unisdr.org/eng/country-inform/reports/Pakistan-report.pdf>
- Woodford, M.H, M.R. Frisina and G.A. Awan, 2004. The Torghar Project: Habitat and Veterinary Concerns for the Management of the Suleiman Markhor (*Capra falconeri megaceros*) and the Afghan Urial (*Ovis orientalis cycloceros*) in the Torghar Hills, Balochistan, Pakistan. Paper for LEAD (Livestock, Environment and Development) Virtual Research and Development Centre, Electronic Conference on Wildlife/Livestock Production Systems Cohabitation or Competition. Where do We Stand Today? Should We Change the Approach? October to January 2005.  
[http://www.virtualcentre.org/fr/ele/econf\\_02\\_faune/download/t2\\_08\\_torghar.doc](http://www.virtualcentre.org/fr/ele/econf_02_faune/download/t2_08_torghar.doc)
- World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987. *Our Common Future.* London: Oxford University Press.

# Millennium Development Goals Targets and Indicators

## Goal 1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

### Target 1: Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than a dollar a day

- Proportion of Population Below \$1 (PPP) per Day (World Bank)
- Poverty Gap Ratio, \$1 per day (World Bank)
- Share of Poorest Quintile in National Income or Consumption (World Bank)

### Target 2: Reduce by half the proportion of people who suffer from hunger

- Prevalence of Underweight Children Under Five Years of Age (UNICEF)
- Proportion of the Population below Minimum Level of Dietary Energy Consumption (FAO)

## Goal 2. Achieve universal primary education

### Target 3: Ensure that all boys and girls complete a full course of primary schooling

- Net Enrolment Ratio in Primary Education (UNESCO)
- Proportion of Pupils Starting Grade 1 who Reach Grade 5 (UNESCO)
- Literacy Rate of 15-24 year-olds (UNESCO)

## Goal 3. Promote gender equality and empower women

### Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005, and at all levels by 2015

- Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary, Secondary, and Tertiary Education (UNESCO)
- Ratio of Literate Women to Men 15-24 years old (UNESCO)
- Share of Women in Wage Employment in the Non-Agricultural Sector (ILO)
- Proportion of Seats Held by Women in National Parliaments (IPU)

## Goal 4. Reduce child mortality

### Target 5: Reduce by two thirds the mortality rate among children under five

- Under-Five Mortality Rate (UNICEF)
- Infant Mortality Rate (UNICEF)
- Proportion of 1 year-old Children Immunised Against Measles (UNICEF)

## Goal 5. Improve maternal health

### Target 6: Reduce by three quarters the maternal mortality ratio

- Maternal Mortality Ratio (WHO)

- Proportion of Births Attended by Skilled Health Personnel (UNICEF)

### **Goal 6. Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases**

#### **Target 7: Halt and begin to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS**

- HIV Prevalence Among 15-24 year-old Pregnant Women (UNAIDS)
- Condom use rate of the contraceptive prevalence rate and Population aged 15-24 years with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS, UNICEF, UN Population Division, WHO)
- Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non-orphans aged 10-14 years

#### **Target 8: Halt and begin to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases**

- Prevalence and Death Rates Associated with Malaria (WHO):
- Proportion of Population in Malaria Risk Areas Using Effective Malaria Prevention and Treatment Measures (UNICEF):
- Prevalence and Death Rates Associated with Tuberculosis (WHO):
- Proportion of Tuberculosis Cases Detected and Cured Under Directly-Observed Treatment Short Courses (WHO)

### **Goal 7. Ensure environmental sustainability**

#### **Target 9: Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes; reverse loss of environmental resources**

- Forested land as age of land area (FAO)
- Ratio of Area Protected to Maintain Biological Diversity to Surface Area (UNEP)
- Energy supply (apparent consumption; Kg oil equivalent) per \$1,000 (PPP) GDP (World Bank)
- Carbon Dioxide Emissions (per capita) and Consumption of Ozone-Depleting CFCs (ODP tons):

#### **Target 10: Reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water**

- Proportion of the Population with Sustainable Access to and Improved Water Source (WHO/UNICEF)

- Proportion of the Population with Access to Improved Sanitation (WHO/UNICEF)

#### **Target 11: Achieve significant improvement in lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers, by 2020**

- Slum population as age of urban population (secure tenure index) (UN-Habitat)

### **Goal 8. Develop a global partnership for development**

#### **Target 12. Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system Includes a commitment to good governance, development, and poverty reduction — both nationally and internationally**

#### **Target 13. Address the special needs of the least developed countries Includes: tariff and quota free access for least developed countries' exports; enhanced programme of debt relief for HIPC and cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous ODA for countries committed to poverty reduction**

#### **Target 14. Address the special needs of landlocked countries and small island developing States**

#### **Target 15. Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term.**

#### **Target 16: In cooperation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth.**

#### **Target 17: In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries.**

#### **Target 18: In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications.**

Source: UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, MDG Targets and Indicators.  
<http://www.undp.org/mdg/goallist.shtml>

## Millennium Development Goals Indicators for Balochistan

	Balochistan	Urban	Rural	Quetta Zarghoon	Quetta Chilton	Qila Saifullah
<b>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</b>						
Have, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger						
Prevalence of underweight in children (under five years of age)	43	41	44	–	–	–
<b>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</b>						
Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be to complete a full course of primary schooling						
Net enrolment ratio in primary education (m)	28	24	46	52	52	29
Net enrolment ratio in primary education (f)	20	16	39	41	39	28
Net enrolment ratio in primary education (tot)	24	20	43	47	47	28
Gross Primary Enrolment rate (m)	56	82	50	89	112	66
Gross Primary Enrolment rate (f)	35	65	30	66	70	51
Gross Primary Enrolment rate (tot)	46	74	40	79	92	59
Net Secondary Enrolment rate (m)	23	41	19	40	34	18
Net Secondary Enrolment rate (f)	14	35	9	38	28	11
Net Secondary Enrolment rate (tot)	19	38	15	39	31	15
Literacy rate 10 years+ (m)	39	65	33	70	63	31
Literacy rate 10 years+ (f)	16	40	10	46	33	11
Literacy rate 10 years+ (tot)	28	54	23	59	49	22
Literacy rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (m)	51	77	45	79	73	47
Literacy rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (f)	24	53	17	54	50	19
Literacy rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (tot)	39	66	32	68	63	35
<b>Goal: 3 Promote gender equality and empower women</b>						
Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and in all levels of education no later than 2015						
Ratio females/males: Net Enrolment ratio in primary education	0.71	0.67	0.85	0.78	0.69	0.96
Ratio females/males: Gross Enrolment ratio in primary education	0.64	0.79	0.59	0.74	0.62	0.77
Ratio females/males: Net Enrolment ratio in secondary education	0.62	0.86	0.48	0.94	0.81	0.57
Ratio of literate females to males among 10+ years	0.41	0.61	0.31	0.67	0.52	0.35
Ratio of literate females to males among 15-to 24-year-olds	0.47	0.69	0.37	0.68	0.69	0.41
Women in wage employment (non-agricultural) % female to total	0.05	0.07	0.04	0.07	0.02	0.03

	Balochistan	Urban	Rural	Quetta Zarghoon	Quetta Chilton	Qila Saifullah
<b>Goal 4: Reduce child mortality</b>						
Reduce by two thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under five mortality rate						
Under-five mortality rate	158	130	164	–	–	–
Infant mortality rate	104	88	106	–	–	–
Proportion of one-year-olds immunized against measles (EPI)	–	–	–	67	–	31
<b>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</b>						
Reduce by three-quarters, between 1990 and 2015 the maternal mortality ratio						
Maternal Mortality Ratio per 100,000 births	600	–	–	–	–	–
Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel	21	47	16	55	74	11
Coverage of Pre-natal care (by any health worker)	53	74	48	75	97	23
Population covered by Lady health workers (LHW's)	21	33	18	26	23	6
<b>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDs, malaria and other diseases</b>						
Contraceptive Prevalence (any)	14	36	10	38	79	4
Contraceptive Prevalence (modern)	13	33	9	35	60	3
Aware of HIV/AIDS	18	51	11	58	56	6
Prevalence of TB (/100,000)	1079	789	1142	106	37	2497
<b>Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</b>						
Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source (U/R) - within 2 km or 1/2 hour away (RT)	48	90	39	97	77	34
Urban/Rural population with access to improve sanitation	40	91	29	97	70	7
<b>Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development</b>						
Implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth. With the private sector, use the benefit of new technologies						
Un-employment rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (m)	33.7	34.8	33.5	27.8	53.9	20.3
Un-employment rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (f)	46.4	44.3	47.1	21.6	73.7	28.3
Un-employment rate of 15-to 24-year-olds (tot)	35.1	35.7	34.8	27.4	54.9	20.8
Telephone lines per 100 population	1.06	0.61	3.07	4.42	2.57	0.17
Mobile phones per 100 population	0.10	0.04	0.38	0.93	0.64	0.00
Personal computers per 100 population	0.08	0.02	0.33	0.63	0.31	0.00
Internet per 100 population	0.04	0.01	0.16	0.40	0.06	0.00
Source: Adapted from GoB, Planning and Development Department in collaboration with Federal Bureau of Statistics and UNICEF, 2004. District-Based Multiple Indicators Cluster Survey 2004. Quetta: GoB						



